



Department of
**Health, Social Services
and Public Safety**

An Roinn
**Sláinte, Seirbhísí Sóisialta
agus Sábháilteachta Poiblí**

www.dhsspsni.gov.uk

Distinction and Meritorious Service Awards Committee

Annual Report 2004-2005

CONTENTS

	Page
Foreword	3
 PART ONE – REPORT ON THE 2004–2005 AWARDS ROUND	
Report on the 2004–2005 Awards Round	4
List of awards granted in 2004 – 2005	9
 Tables	
Table 1: Analysis by Specialty	10
Table 2: Analysis by Gender	11
Table 3: Analysis by Area	11
Table 4: Analysis by Age	12
Table 5: Analysis by Ethnic Origin	12
Table 6: Analysis by Community Background	13
 PART TWO – CONSULTANT DISTINCTION AWARD HOLDERS	
Introduction	14
List of award holders in Northern Ireland	16
 APPENDICES	
Appendix A – Report on Monitoring of Discretionary Points	23
Appendix B – Membership of DMSAC	27

FOREWORD

This is the eleventh Annual Report of the Distinction and Meritorious Service Awards Committee (DMSAC) for Northern Ireland. It covers the period from 1 April 2004 to 31 March 2005.

The Annual Report is in two parts. Part One contains our report on the 2004-2005 awards round and includes a list of all consultants recommended for awards, and is supported by tables analysing the distribution of awards amongst the HPSS consultant population. Part Two contains a list of all consultants in Northern Ireland who are currently in receipt of distinction awards, including those who were granted awards in the 2004-2005 awards round.

Since the scheme was revised in 2001 when changes were introduced to make the system of awards fairer and more open and transparent, there has been a substantial increase in the number of applications for awards. This year a total of 204 applications were received.

The scheme has undergone a major review, following agreement on a new contract for consultants. This is the final year of the current system of awards. A new Clinical Excellence Awards Scheme will be introduced in 2005. I would wish to pay tribute and express sincere thanks to the Medical Director and members of the Committee for their hard work, support and sustained commitment throughout my period as Chairman.

The Annual Report will be distributed to all HSS Trusts and HSS Boards and to others with an interest in the scheme. The report will also be available on the internet at www.dhsspsni.gov.uk/hss/dmsac/dmsac.asp.

Dr Harry McGuigan
Chairman
Distinction and Meritorious Service Awards Committee

PART ONE

REPORT ON THE 2004-2005 AWARDS ROUND

Introduction

1. The purpose of the Distinction and Meritorious Service Awards Scheme is to reward medical and dental consultants for outstanding professional work. The Committee recommends to the Department which medical and dental consultants should receive distinction awards, having regard to the total number of awards available for allocation. This is the eleventh Annual Report of the Distinction and Meritorious Service Awards Committee (DMSAC) and covers the 2004-2005 awards round.

Membership of DMSAC

2. The membership of the Committee for the 2004-2005 awards round was as follows -

Chairman

Dr RH McGuigan CBE

Medical Director

Dr DAJ Keegan OBE

Members

Dr IW Carson

Mrs MFA Cook OBE

Professor PJ Kumar CBE

Dr M Morgan

Professor RW Stout

Mrs E Way

3. The two members from Great Britain, Dr Morgan and Professor Kumar, have senior experience within the NHS and are appointed in order to ensure parity of standards.
4. Appendix B gives details of all the Committee members.

2004-2005 Awards Round

5. The awards round commenced in February 2004 and was completed in October 2004. The Committee invited self nominations from all HPSS consultants in February and a total of 204 were received (compared with 208 in the previous year). There were 161 applications for B awards, 35 for A awards, and 8 for A+ awards. There were 8 B awards and 6 A awards available for allocation. There were no A+ awards available for allocation.
6. This year, for the first time, the two GB members were involved in the shortlisting process. The committee completed shortlisting of all the A and B applications in September 2004. Scores were agreed for all 161 B and 35 A applications. A cut off score was agreed for shortlisting, resulting in 13 A and 16 B applications being shortlisted for the final meeting.
7. The final Committee meeting for the 2004-2005 awards round was held in October 2004 when all the shortlisted A and B applications were considered. After careful deliberation scores were agreed for the shortlisted A and B applications. Those consultants who achieved the highest scores were recommended for distinction awards, taking account of the number of awards available for allocation. The Committee recommended 14 consultants for awards: 6 A and 8 B awards. The names of the successful consultants are listed on page 9 of this report. A full list of all consultants in Northern Ireland, holding an award following the 2004-2005 awards round, is included at Part Two.
8. In October 2004 the Committee visited Causeway Hospital in Coleraine and also Antrim Area Hospital. The Committee was most impressed by the developments at these sites and was grateful for the warm welcome they received. Consultants were given the opportunity of questioning the Committee about its work.

Five Year Reviews

9. All awards are reviewed every five years. The five year review process is an important process to ensure that consultants in receipt of awards continue to meet the criteria for awards. The Committee can withdraw or downgrade an award if it believes an individual consultant does not continue to fulfil the criteria. The five year review process does not, of course, preclude the Committee from considering a case within the five year review cycle if there are concerns about a consultant's performance or conduct. It is important that employers bring any such concerns to the attention of the Committee.
10. A total of 20 awards were subject to review in this awards round. The Committee Chairman and the Committee Medical Director carefully considered the CV forms and the citation forms relating to each consultant whose award was subject to review and reported their findings to the full Committee at its meeting in November. The Committee recommended that all 20 awards should continue for a further five years.

Distribution of Awards

11. The Committee secretariat monitors the distribution of awards in six areas: specialty, gender, Board area, age, community background, and ethnic origin. This was the third year that data was collected on community background and ethnic origin. The purpose of monitoring the outcome of awards is to identify any unjustifiable imbalances in the distribution of awards. However, it must be emphasised that awards are granted to individuals solely on the grounds of merit. The Committee does not positively discriminate in favour of any particular group, nor does it have any plans to do so. It is highly unlikely in a competitive process such as this (and given the small number of awards available annually) that there will be an equal proportion of awards between the various groups. Nevertheless, the monitoring process is extremely important; it is essential that any imbalances are addressed and that the reasons for those imbalances are fully examined.

Specialty

12. There are variations in the distribution of awards across the range of specialties (see Table 1). For this awards round most of the available awards again went to the largest specialty - General Medicine and Allied Specialties (42.9% of all awards). Anaesthetics, ENT and Paediatrics all fared well each with 14.3% of all awards, an improvement on last year particularly for the last two specialties who received no awards last year. This year seven specialties received no awards – Mental Illness, Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Ophthalmology, Orthopaedics, Public Health Medicine, Radiology and Dental Specialties. An analysis of the overall distribution of awards following the 2004-2005 awards round shows that specialties such as Ophthalmology, Orthopaedics and Radiology continue to have a lower proportion of awards.

Gender

13. In the 2004-2005 awards round female consultants did not receive any awards. They represent about 25% of the consultant population and now hold 11% of the total awards in Northern Ireland (127). There is clearly an under representation of female consultant award holders. The Committee would, however, wish to emphasise that awards are granted to individuals solely on the grounds of merit. It considers that it would be wrong to resort to positive discrimination in favour of any particular group. The Committee would certainly welcome more self nominations from female consultants since only 11.8% (a slight increase in last year's 10.5%) of all self nominations were from women.

Board Areas

14. The total number of eligible consultants in April 2004 was 993 spread between the geographical areas of the four Health and Social Services Boards as follows

(consultants in Trusts are for this purpose included in the area in which their Trusts are situated) -

Northern	129
Southern	124
Western	139
Eastern	601

15. The pattern of distribution shows that the Eastern Board area contains about 61% of the total consultant population, but holds 78.7% of all awards (see Table 3). For this awards round 78.6% of all awards went to consultants in the Eastern Board area, a decrease on last year when it was 86.4%. 14.3% of awards went to consultants in the Western Board area (similar to last year). The Southern Board, who did not receive any awards last year, were awarded 7.1% (1 award) this year. No awards went to consultants in the Northern Board area again this year. There is clearly an imbalance in the geographical distribution of awards. It must be recognised that a greater number of applicants are likely to come from the larger hospitals (particularly those providing regional specialties) and Queen's University, which are located in the Eastern Board area.

Age

16. The average age of those consultants who received an award in 2004-2005 was 51 for B awards and 53 for A awards. (see Table 4). This pattern of distribution is not unexpected. It is likely that award holders will tend to be older, particularly A award holders, given the experience and length of time needed to achieve the very high standards required. However, it should be noted that the average age in the A category reduced by 2 years from last year (when it was 55). It is also noteworthy that one A and three B awards were granted to consultants in the 45 - 49 age band.

Ethnic Origin

17. Out of the 204 consultants who applied three did not complete the relevant data on the monitoring form. 5.9% of consultants who applied for an award declared themselves as coming from the smaller ethnic groups (see Table 5) (up slightly on last year when it was 4.4%). It is estimated that the number applying broadly equates to the proportion in the consultant population as a whole. 14.3% (2 awards) of awards went to consultants from the ethnic groupings (an increase on last year when it was 4.5%). This is our third year of monitoring awards by ethnic origin and it will take some time before we can identify any particular trends in the distribution of awards in this area.

Community Background

18. Most consultants provided the relevant information on community background on the monitoring form – only four of the 204 who applied for an award did not record the data. An analysis of those who applied for an award shows that 59.4% declared themselves as coming from a Protestant community (PC) background, 25.5% from a Roman Catholic community (RCC) background, 13.3% from “neither” a PC nor a RCC background and 2% were “not knowns” (see Table 6). These proportions of applicants were similar to last year. Based on information received from employers we estimate that around 50% of the consultant population as a whole are from a PC background, and around 30% are from a RCC background. The number of self nominations received therefore equates to the proportions in the consultant population as a whole.
19. An analysis of the awards in this round shows that 57.1% of awards went to consultants who had declared themselves as coming from a PC background, 14.3% went to consultants who had declared themselves as coming from a RCC background and 28.6% who had declared themselves as coming from neither a PC nor a RCC background. (see Table 6). The proportion of awards going to consultants from a RCC background represents a significant decrease on last year, when it was 36.4%. It will however, take a few years to identify particular trends given that this is only our third year of monitoring awards in this area.

Discretionary Points Monitoring

20. The Committee is required to monitor the discretionary points awarded by Trusts/Boards to ensure the minimum number of points have been awarded. Monitoring for the 2004/2005 year began in August 2004 when data was requested from 18 Trusts and 4 HSS Boards. Analysis of the data received shows that employers are adhering to the guidelines and are awarding at least the minimum number of points (0.35 per eligible consultant). See report at Appendix A.

Further Information

21. Further information about the scheme or additional copies of the Guide or the Annual Report can be obtained by contacting the DMSAC secretariat either by telephone (028 905 22869) or by writing to the DMSAC secretariat at Room D1, Castle Buildings, Upper Newtownards Road, Belfast, BT4 3SJ. The Guide and the Annual Report are also available on the internet at www.dhsspsni.gov.uk/hss/dmsac/dmsac.asp

LIST OF AWARDS GRANTED IN 2004-2005

The following consultants employed by the HPSS in Northern Ireland were granted Distinction Awards following the 2004-2005 Annual Meeting.

A AWARD

NAME	SPECIALTY	HPSS EMPLOYER	EFFECTIVE DATE OF AWARD
Crean P M	Anaesthetics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2004
Elborn J S	Medicine-Respiratory	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2004
Kaluskar S K	ENT	Sperrin Lakeland HSS Trust	03/08/2004
Maw R D	Genito-Urinary Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2004
Mc Clelland W M	Pathology/Haematology	Northern Ireland Blood Transfusion Service Agency	01/10/2004
Spence R A J	General Surgery	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2004

B AWARD

NAME	SPECIALTY	HPSS EMPLOYER	EFFECTIVE DATE OF AWARD
Craig B G	Paediatric Cardiology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2004
Dinsmore W W	Genito-Urinary Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2004
Eedy D J	Dermatology	Craigavon Area Hospital Group HSS Trust	03/08/2004
Gilmore D H	Geriatric Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2004
Jackson P T	Paediatrics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2004
Murray J M	Anaesthetics	Green Park HSS Trust	01/04/2004
Toner J G	ENT	Ulster Community and Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2004
Varma M P S	General Medicine	Sperrin Lakeland HSS Trust	01/10/2004

TABLE 1

ANALYSIS BY SPECIALTY AT 1 APRIL 2004 (2004-2005 AWARDS ROUND)

SPECIALTY	CONSULTANTS WHO APPLIED FOR AN AWARD 2004/2005		CONSULTANTS WHO RECEIVED AWARDS 2004/2005		CONSULTANTS HOLDING AWARDS		DISTRIBUTION OF AWARDS BY GRADE				
	No	% of consultant body	No	% of self nominations	No	% of available awards	No	% of overall awards	A+	A	B
Anaesthetics	165	16.5%	26	12.7%	2	14.3%	17	13.3%	2	6	9
ENT	21	2.1%	6	2.9%	2	14.3%	5	3.9%	-	2	3
General Medicine & Allied Specialties (1)	219	21.8%	54	26.5%	6	42.9%	36	28.3%	3	11	22
Mental Illness (2)	105	10.5%	19	9.3%	-	-	6	4.8%	1	2	3
Obs & Gynae	57	5.7%	11	5.4%	-	-	6	4.8%	-	2	4
Ophthalmology	22	2.2%	3	1.4%	-	-	2	1.6%	-	-	2
Orthopaedics	35	3.5%	1	0.5%	-	-	3	2.4%	-	1	2
Paediatrics	62	6.2%	9	4.4%	2	14.3%	11	8.6%	1	3	7
Pathology (3)	69	6.9%	21	10.3%	1	7.1%	8	6.3%	2	1	5
Public Health Medicine (4)	34	3.4%	6	2.9%	-	-	6	4.8%	-	1	5
Radiology (5)	89	8.9%	11	5.4%	-	-	4	3.1%	-	1	3
Surgery (6)	99	9.9%	27	13.2%	1	7.1%	17	13.4%	-	6	11
Dental Specialties (7)	25	2.5%	10	4.9%	-	-	6	4.8%	-	1	5
TOTALS	1002		204		14		127		9	37	81

NOTES

- (1) GENERAL MEDICINE & ALLIED SPECIALTIES - Anatomy, Accident & Emergency, Cardiology, Clinical Neuro-Physiology, Clinical Genetics, Clinical Pharmacology, Dermatology, Endocrinology and Diabetes, General Medicine, General Medicine-Special Interest Geriatrics, Genito-Urinary Medicine, Geriatric Medicine, Infectious Diseases, Nephrology, Neurology, Physiology, Rheumatology, Rehabilitation Medicine, Sports Medicine.
- (2) MENTAL ILLNESS - Child & Adolescent Psychiatry, Forensic Psychiatry, Mental Handicap, Mental Illness, Psychiatry of Old Age, Psychotherapy.
- (3) PATHOLOGY - Chemical Pathology, General Pathology, Haematology & Blood Transfusion, Histology, Histopathology, Immuno-Pathology, Medical Microbiology, Neuropathology.
- (4) PUBLIC HEALTH MEDICINE - Occupational Medicine, Public Health Medicine.3
- (5) RADIOLOGY - Radiology, Radiotherapy, Medical Oncology.
- (6) SURGERY - Cardiothoracic Surgery, General Surgery, Neurosurgery, Paediatric Surgery, Plastic Surgery, Urology.
- (7) DENTAL SPECIALTIES - Dental Anatomy, Dental Prosthetics, Oral Surgery, Paediatric & Preventative Dentistry, Periodontics, Restorative Dentistry, Orthodontics

TABLE 2**ANALYSIS BY GENDER**

FEMALE				MALE				
	Self Nominations		Awards Granted		Self Nominations		Awards Granted	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
A+	0	0	0	0	8	3.9	0	0
A	2	1.0	0	0	33	16.1	6	42.9
B	22	10.8	0	0	139	68.1	8	57.15
Total	24	11.8	0	0	180	88.2	14	100

NOTE A total of 204 self nominations were received and a total of 14 awards were granted.

TABLE 3**ANALYSIS BY BOARD AREA**

	NORTHERN	SOUTHERN	EASTERN	WESTERN
NUMBER OF CONSULTANTS	129	124	610	139
%	12.9	12.3	61	13.8
NUMBER OF SELF NOMINATIONS	20	21	139	24
%	9.8	10.3	68.1	11.8
AWARDS GRANTED	0	1	11	2
%	0	7.1	78.6	14.3
NUMBER OF TOTAL AWARDS PER AREA	6	7	100	14
% OF TOTAL AWARDS (out of 127)	4.7	5.5	78.7	11.1

TABLE 4

ANALYSIS OF NEW AWARDS BY AGE

AGE GROUP	NEW AWARDS		
	A+	A	B
35-39	-	-	-
40-44	-	-	-
45-49	-	1	3
50-54	-	2	3
55-59	-	2	1
60-64	-	1	1
TOTAL	-	6	8
AVERAGE AGE	-	53	51

TABLE 5

ANALYSIS BY ETHNIC ORIGIN

ETHNIC ORIGIN	NO. OF SELF NOMINATIONS	%	NO. OF AWARDS GRANTED	%
WHITE	189	92.7	12	85.7
NOT KNOWN	3	1.5	-	-
INDIAN	9	4.4	2	14.3
EAST AFRICAN ASIAN	-	-	-	-
MIXED ETHNIC	-	-	-	-
CHINESE	1	0.5	-	-
NORTH AFRICAN	1	0.5	-	-
PAKISTANI	1	0.5	-	-
TOTAL*	12	5.9	2	14.3

*NOTE – the totals and % figures relate to the ethnic groups.

TABLE 6

ANALYSIS BY COMMUNITY BACKGROUND

AWARD	PC				RCC				NEITHER				NOT KNOWN			
	SELF NOMINATIONS		AWARDS GRANTED		SELF NOMINATIONS		AWARDS GRANTED		SELF NOMINATIONS		AWARDS GRANTED		SELF NOMINATIONS		AWARDS GRANTED	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
A+	5	2.5	0	-	2	1	0	-	0	-	0	-	1	0.5	0	-
A	31	15.2	5	35.7	2	1	0	-	2	1	1	7.2	-	-	0	-
B	85	41.7	3	21.4	48	23.5	2	14.3	25	12.3	3	21.4	3	1.5	0	-
TOTAL	121	59.4	8	57.1	52	25.5	2	14.3	27	13.3	4	28.6	4	2.0	0	-

NOTE:

PC – consultants who declared themselves as members of the Protestant community.

RCC - consultants who declared themselves as members of the Roman Catholic community.

NEITHER - consultants who declared themselves as members of neither the Protestant nor the Roman Catholic community.

NOT KNOWN – consultants who did not complete the monitoring form.

PART TWO

CONSULTANT DISTINCTION AWARD HOLDERS

1. Part Two of this Annual Report lists all consultants employed by the HPSS in Northern Ireland who held an award immediately following the 2004-2005 Distinction Awards Round.

Criteria for Distinction Awards

2. Distinction Awards are granted in recognition of outstanding professional work, often of national and international significance, which involves consultants devoting a substantial part of their time to activities of wider benefit to patient care in the HPSS/NHS as a whole, including work carried out in the local setting, particularly where this has application nationally.
3. Awards are not seniority payments, nor are they given to holders of particular types of post as of right. To merit consideration for an award, DMSAC will look for performance **over and above** what is normally expected in respect of service to patients, teaching and the management and development of the service. In general DMSAC will expect a record of achievement across a range of the criteria listed below from consultants nominated for an award; success in only one of these areas will not normally be sufficient.
 - (1) Professional excellence, which for most consultants will be founded on the sustained quality of the service they provide to patient care and recognition of leadership.
 - (2) Research, innovation and improvement in the service. The expectations will vary for different groups – e.g. Health Board or Trust, teaching and Joint appointments - and will relate to their differing opportunities in these different environments.
 - (3) Outstanding administrative or management effort, including those who effectively implement innovations, involving activities often of national significance, which will again be related to opportunity and above normal expectations. For example, Joint Appointments (eg clinical academic staff and research workers) whose duties include a small HPSS/NHS management content will often not contribute substantially in this area. Consultants working in community and management-based specialties such as public health medicine and dental public health are expected, on the other hand, to secure measurable achievement in service development as part of their normal work, so that they have to be assessed on the basis of above-average effort or contribution.

- (4) An outstanding contribution to other forms of service development such as clinical audit, clinical governance, the effective promulgation of evidence-based medicine, and external evaluation and audit.
 - (5) Teaching and training; for example, special effort to train junior staff, or taking a leading role in undergraduate teaching or postgraduate medical education, (including the establishment of short-term national or overseas training links), especially if undertaken in addition to ordinary duties. Contribution by consultants to training of other HPSS/NHS staff, and also to public education and health promotion will also be relevant.
 - (6) Outstanding commitment to the achievement of service goals, innovative service delivery, and the sustained delivery of high quality patient care in hard-pressed service areas.
4. For the smaller number of awards available at A and A+ level, a very high standard is inevitably required. Awards might be recommended for those who are evident leaders in a clinical or scientific field, those with special clinical and managerial skills, those who contribute new ideas of proven worth, those who effectively implement innovations, those who are generally accepted as leaders of their profession in Northern Ireland and those with a national or international reputation.

LIST OF AWARD HOLDERS IN NORTHERN IRELAND

A+ AWARD HOLDERS

NAME	SPECIALTY	HPSS EMPLOYER	DATE OF AWARD
Adgey A A J	Cardiology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	02/01/2000
Atkinson A B	Medicine/ Endocrinology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2003
Carson I W	Anaesthetics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2000
Halliday H L	Paediatrics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2000
McClelland R J	Psychiatry - Adult	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	10/09/2003
Mirakhur R K	Anaesthetics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2001
Morris T C M	Pathology/Haematology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/11/2003
Stout R W	Geriatric Medicine	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/02/2000
Trimble E R	Chemical Pathology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/08/2001

A AWARD HOLDERS

NAME	SPECIALTY	HPSS EMPLOYER	DATE OF AWARD
Boston V E	Paediatric Surgery	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/1999
Boyle D D	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2003
Callender M E	General Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2003
Campbell N P S	Cardiology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2002
Campbell W I	Anaesthetics	Ulster Community and Hospitals HSS Trust	01/08/2001
Carson D J	Paediatrics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	27/04/2002
Connolly J D R	Anaesthetics	Green Park HSS Trust	01/11/2000
Cooper S J	Psychiatry-Adult	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/07/2002
Crean PM	Anaesthetics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2004
Doherty C C	Nephrology (Renal)	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/06/2001
Elborn J S	Medicine-Respiratory	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2004
Evans A E	Public Health Medicine	Eastern Health and Social Services Board	13/08/1999
Fee J P H	Anaesthetics	Green Park Hospital HSS Trust	02/01/2000
Gillespie C A	Psychiatry-Adult	Sperrin Lakeland HSS Trust	01/10/2003
Hawkins S A	Neurology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2001
Hay R	Dermatology	The Queen's University	01/04/2002
Humphreys W G	General Surgery	United Hospitals HSS Trust	01/10/2000
Jenkins J G	Paediatrics	United Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2001
Johnston G D	Clinical Pharmacology & Therapeutics	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/1999
Johnston P G	Medical Oncology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2003
Johnston S R	Urology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	11/03/2002
Kaluskar S K	ENT	Sperrin Lakeland HSS Trust	03/08/2004

A AWARD HOLDERS

NAME	SPECIALTY	HPSS EMPLOYER	DATE OF AWARD
Lamey P-J	Oral Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2001
MacMahon J	General Medicine	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2003
Marsh D R	Orthopaedic & Traumatic Surgery	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2001
Martin D H	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Altnagelvin Hospitals HSS Trust	02/08/1999
Maw R D	Genito-Urinary Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2004
McCaughey W	Anaesthetics	Craigavon Area Hospital Group HSS Trust	31/05/1999
Mc Clelland W M	Pathology/Haematology	N.I. Blood Transfusion Service Agency	01/10/2004
McFarland R J	General Medicine	Ulster Community and Hospitals HSS Trust	01/08/2002
McMurray T J	Anaesthetics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	10/09/2003
O'Connor F A	General Medicine	Altnagelvin Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2001
Panesar K J S	General Surgery	Altnagelvin Hospitals HSS Trust	01/11/2003
Russell C F J	General Surgery	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2000
Savage J M	Paediatrics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/12/2000
Singh K P	ENT (Otolaryngology)	Craigavon Area Hospital Group HSS Trust	01/04/2000
Spence R A J	General Surgery	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2004

B AWARD HOLDERS

NAME	SPECIALTY	HPSS EMPLOYER	DATE OF AWARD
Abram W P	Radiotherapy	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/08/2001
Adams D A	ENT	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	12/09/2000
Andrews W J	General Medicine	United Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2001
Bali I M	Anaesthetics	United Hospitals HSS Trust	01/06/1995
Bell A H	Paediatrics	Ulster Community and Hospitals HSS Trust	01/10/2002
Bell P M	General Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/11/2000
Beringer T R O	Geriatric Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2001
Beverland D E	Orthopaedic & Traumatic Surgery	Green Park HSS Trust	01/04/2003
Bingham E A	Dermatology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/08/1998
Brennen M D	Plastic Surgery	Ulster Community and Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/1999
Campbell F C	Gaestroenterological Surgery	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2001
Cinnamond M J	ENT (Otolaryngology)	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/05/1996
Collins J S A	General Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2003
Coyle P V	Pathology – Medical Microbiology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2003
Craig B G	Paediatric Cardiology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2004
Cranley B	General Surgery	Newry & Mourne HSS Trust	09/06/2000
Daly J G	General Medicine	Altnagelvin Hospitals HSS Trust	01/07/2002
Diamond T	General Surgery	Mater Infirmorum HSS Trust	01/10/2001
Dinsmore W W	Genito-Urinary Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2004
Dornan J C	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	02/08/1999
Dowey K E	Accident & Emergency Medicine	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2003

B AWARD HOLDERS

NAME	SPECIALTY	HPSS EMPLOYER	DATE OF AWARD
Eedy D J	Dermatology	Craigavon Area Hospital Group HSS Trust	03/08/2004
Elliott P M	Anaesthetics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2000
Farling P A	Anaesthetics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2001
Fullerton K J	Geriatric Medicine	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2002
Fulton R A	Dermatology	Altnagelvin Hospitals HSS Trust	28/01/2001
Gardiner K R	General Surgery	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	13/09/2002
Gilmore D H	Geriatric Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2004
Gregg T A	Paediatric Dentistry	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2001
Hannon R J	General Surgery	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2003
Harper M A	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/06/2003
Hicks E M	Paediatrics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2001
Hood J M	General Surgery	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/1997
Houston R F	Radiotherapy	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2001
Irwin S T	General Surgery	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2001
Jackson P T	Paediatrics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2004
Johnston J R	Anaesthetics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/1998
Johnston L C	Radiology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2000
Johnston P B	Ophthalmology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/1995
Jones F G C	Pathology-Haematology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/06/2001
Kee F	Public Health Medicine	Northern Health and Social Services Board	01/04/2002
Kelly J F	Geriatric Medicine	Sperrin Lakeland HSS Trust	01/02/2003
Kendrick R W	Oral Surgery	Ulster Community and Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2001

B AWARD HOLDERS

NAME	SPECIALTY	HPSS EMPLOYER	DATE OF AWARD
Kennedy J G	Restorative Dentistry	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2002
Kirk S J	General Surgery	Ulster Community and Hospitals Trust	01/06/2003
Lavery G G	Anaesthetics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2003
Linden G J	Dental Medicine Specialties	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/08/2002
Loughran P G	Anaesthetics	Newry and Mourne HSS Trust	01/10/1998
Maxwell A P	Nephrology (Renal)	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2002
Maxwell R J	General Surgery	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/09/2000
McClure N	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/06/2003
McCluskey D R	General Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals And Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2002
McConnell W W M	Public Health Medicine	Western Health and Social Services Board	02/04/1997
McGinnity M G A	Psychiatry-Learning Disability	North & West Belfast HSS Trust	01/08/2001
McGuigan J A	Thoracic Surgery	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2000
McLoughlin J C	General Medicine	Mater Infirmorum Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2000
McMullin M F	Pathology-Haematology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/08/2002
Montgomery E A	Psychiatry-Adult	Mater Infirmorum Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/1999
Murray J M	Anaesthetics	Green Park HSS Trust	01/04/2004
Nicholls D P	General Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	31/05/1999
Orr I A	Anaesthetics	Craigavon Area Hospital Group HSS Trust	01/08/2001
Passmore A P	Geriatric Medicine	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/06/2003
Patterson D G	Psychiatry-Adult	North & West Belfast HSS Trust	01/12/2000
Quinn R J M	Paediatrics	Altnagelvin Hospitals HSS Trust	01/10/1997

B AWARD HOLDERS

NAME	SPECIALTY	HPSS EMPLOYER	DATE OF AWARD
Russell C J	General Medicine	Sperrin Lakeland HSS Trust	01/10/1997
Saunders I D F	Paediatric Dentistry	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/1996
Sharma N K	Ophthalmology	Altnagelvin Hospitals HSS Trust	01/09/2002
Shields M D	Paediatrics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	27/04/2002
Smyth E T M	Pathology-Medical-Microbiology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/07/2001
Stewart D G T	Public Health Medicine	Eastern Health and Social Services Board	31/12/2002
Stewart M C	Paediatrics	North & West Belfast HSS Trust	01/08/2001
Taggart H M	Geriatric Medicine	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2000
Taylor I C	Geriatric Medicine	Ulster Community and Hospitals HSS Trust	01/10/2003
Taylor R H	Anaesthetics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2001
Telford A M	Public Health Medicine	Southern Health and Social Services Board	01/10/1999
Toner J G	ENT	Ulster Community and Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2004
Traub A I	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2000
Varma M P S	General Medicine	Sperrin Lakeland HSS Trust	01/10/2004
Watson J D	Public Health Medicine	Northern Health and Social Services Board	02/05/1999
Wray A R	Orthopaedic & Traumatic Surgery	Altnagelvin Hospitals HSS Trust	01/06/2003
Young I S	Chemical Pathology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2001

MONITORING OF CONSULTANTS DISCRETIONARY POINTS 2004/2005

Introduction

1. The Committee is required to monitor the discretionary points awarded by Trusts/Boards to ensure the minimum number of points have been awarded. Monitoring for the 2004/2005 year began in August 2004. Monitoring data was requested from 18 Trusts and 4 HSS Boards.

Results of monitoring 2004/2005

2. To date, data has been received from 3 HSS Boards and from 10 HSS Trusts. See table attached, Annex 1. Of the remaining:-
 - one Trust, Armagh & Dungannon, are reviewing the situation in light of Consultants' contract implementation. They have been advised that it is appropriate to proceed with consideration of the award of discretionary points for 2004/2005.
 - The Northern Board and seven Trusts have advised that their Committees had either not yet met or would be meeting later this year and information would be forwarded in due course:

Belfast City Hospital
Green Park
Mater Infirmorum Hospital
North & West Belfast
Newry & Mourne
Sperrin Lakeland
Ulster Community & Hospitals

3. Analysis of the data received shows that employers are adhering to the guidelines and are awarding at least the minimum number of points (0.35 per eligible consultant). Overall, 173 points were awarded which compares well with the minimum required of 160.
4. We will continue to monitor those Trusts who have not met and who have not provided us with the relevant data. The results of that monitoring will be included in the report for 2005-2006.

Results of monitoring for outstanding 2003/2004 points

5. At the last monitoring round (2003-2004) a number of Trusts had not met to decide on points and we undertook to follow those up. There were eight Trusts involved and seven of them have since met and provided us with the relevant data. They have adhered to the guidelines and awarded the minimum number of points with the exception of North & West Belfast where no applications for discretionary points were received for 2003/2004. The data is set out in the table below.

HSS TRUST	No Eligible Consultants	Minimum Points Required	Number of Points awarded
Armagh & Dungannon	6	2.1	3
Mater Infirmorum Hosp.	18	6.3	8
North & West Belfast	2	0.7	0
Newry & Mourne	18	6.3	7
Royal Hospitals Group	152	53.2	57
Ulster Comm.& Hospitals	71	24.9	26
South & East Belfast	10	3.5	4

6. The remaining Trust, Greenpark awarded points for 2002/2003, there were 21 eligible consultants and 7 points were awarded. They have advised that they will meet in November to decide points for 2003/2004.
7. Last year it was reported that South & East Belfast Trust had not met to consider discretionary points for the three years; 2001/2002, 2002/2003 and 2003/2004. They are now back on course and, in addition to the points referred to above for 2003/2004, they have also awarded points for 2001/2002 and 2002/2003.

Spread of Discretionary Points

8. At last year's annual meeting the secretariat was asked to provide, for the next meeting, details of the spread of discretionary points in each Trust/ Board. Details are shown in the table set out in Annex 2.

ANNEX 1

Monitoring of Consultants Discretionary Points 2004/05

Trust/Board	No of eligible consultants	Minimum points required	Number of points awarded
Altnagelvin	63	22	23
Craigavon Area Hospital	52	18.2	19
Craigavon & Banbridge	8	2.8	3
Causeway	31	10.9	12
Down/Lisburn	35	12.3	14
EHSSB	6	2.1	3
Foyle	7	2.5	3
Homefirst	11	3.9	6
Royal Group of Hospitals	159	55.7	58
South and East Belfast	10	3.5	4
SHSSB	7	2.5	2
United Hospitals	66	23.1	25
WHSSB	1	0.4	1
TOTAL	456	159.9	173

SPREAD OF DISCRETIONARY POINTS IN TRUSTS/BOARDS – 2003/2004

Employer	No. Cons. employed	No. Cons. eligible for DP's	No. Cons. holding DP's	Percentage of eligible Consultants in receipt of one or more Discretionary Point
ADG	8	6	3	50%
ALT	81	68	35	52%
BCH	153	98	69	70%
CAH	75	52	46	89%
CBB	7	7	4	57%
CSY	31	30	25	83%
DLB	39	30	30	100%
EHSSB	10	6	6	100%
FYL	10	9	7	78%
GPK	30	21	11	52% (02/03 yr)
HFT	20	15	11	73%
MIH	27	18	15	83%
NHSSB	7	5	3	60%
NWB	9	2	1	50%
NYM	27	18	11	61%
RGH	247	152	74	49%
SEB	13	10	9	90%
SHSSB	7	7	5	71%
SPL	40	32	28	88%
UCH	79	71	42	59%
UTD	73	67	51	76%
WHSSB	3	2	2	100%

APPENDIX B

DISTINCTION AND MERITORIOUS SERVICE AWARDS COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP - 2004-2005 AWARDS ROUND

CHAIRMAN

Dr Harry McGuigan CBE Chairman Northern Ireland Medical and Dental Training Agency

MEDICAL DIRECTOR

Dr Donal A J Keegan OBE Emeritus Consultant Physician at Altnagelvin Area Hospital Trust. Chairman of the Regional Advisory Committee on Cancer.

MEMBERS

Dr Ian W Carson Deputy Chief Medical Officer and former Consultant Anaesthetist at the Royal Group of Hospitals HSS Trust.

Mrs Fionnuala Cook OBE Chairman Southern Health and Social Services Board.

Professor Parveen J Kumar CBE Professor of Clinical Medical Education at the University of London, and Honorary Consultant Physician and Gastroenterologist at Barts and The London NHS Trust and Homerton Hospital NHS Trust. Chairman, Medicines Commission UK. Vice-President of the Royal College of Physicians (London).

Dr Maldwyn Morgan Retired Reader in Anaesthetic Practice at the Imperial College School of Medicine, London, and Honorary Consultant Anaesthetist at Hammersmith Hospital.

Professor Robert W Stout Director of the Research and Development Office of the HPSS (NI), Consultant Physician at Belfast City Hospital and Professor of Geriatric Medicine at Queen's University Belfast.

Mrs Elaine Way Chief Executive Foyle HSS Trust and Past President of The Association of Healthcare Human Resources Management.

**Produced by: Department of Health, Social Services & Public Safety,
Castle Buildings, Belfast BT4 3SL**

Telephone: (028) 9052 2817 Textphone: (028) 9052 7668

www.dhsspsni.gov.uk

March 2005

Ref:289/2005