

# **NORTHERN IRELAND CLINICAL EXCELLENCE AWARDS**

## **REPORT ON THE OUTCOME OF LOWER AWARDS FOR THE 2007/2008 AWARDS ROUND**

1. The Northern Ireland Clinical Excellence Awards Committee (NICEAC) has a monitoring and quality assurance role over the lower awards process. Trusts are required to report annually to NICEAC on the outcome of the local process. At the time of publication of NICEAC's annual report (for 2007/2008) in August 2008, only two Trusts had submitted reports on the outcome of their lower awards for 2007/2008. The final Trust report for 2007/2008 was not received by NICEAC until January 2009. The committee therefore undertook to publish a separate report on the lower awards process.
2. The committee was disappointed with the delay in the completion of the local awards process bearing in mind that the awards were effective from 1 April 2007. The committee would recommend that all trusts bring their lower awards timetable into line with that of the higher awards, and that reports should be submitted to NICEAC no later than 31 March in the relevant year.
3. In their individual reports to NICEAC Trusts are required to provide details of the composition of the local panel, the names of the successful consultants, and a breakdown of the distribution of awards by various groupings. Trusts must also demonstrate that the local process has been completed fairly and in accordance with the guidance issued by the Department.

### **Results of Monitoring 2007/2008**

4. All five Trusts have now completed their local awards round process for 2007/2008 with a total of 125 lower awards being made in 2007/2008. This compares favourably with 110 awards made in 2006/2007 and 71 in 2005/2006. In view of its concern about the lack of local awards, the Department allocated an additional £100k to Trusts in the 2007/2008 year. This additional funding has helped to contribute to the increase in the overall number of lower awards for 2007/2008. Table 1 gives a breakdown of the number of awards made by Trust. The names of the successful consultants and the current level of award held are listed in Annex 1.
5. All Trusts provided details in their reports of the composition of Local Awards Panels. The committee was satisfied that the panels were set up in accordance with the guidance issued by the Department and that the processes adopted by Trusts were completed fairly.

## **Distribution of Lower Awards**

6. An analysis of the distribution of awards by gender, community background, and ethnic origin has been carried out, in terms of applications and awards made. However, we do not hold sufficient data on the overall breakdown of existing lower award holders by community background and ethnic origin. The total number of consultants now in receipt of a lower clinical excellence award/discretionary point is 521 (251 lower CEAs, 270 discretionary points). Table 2 gives details of the numbers of consultants in receipt of each lower award/discretionary point.

### ***Gender***

7. The proportion of female consultants applying for a lower award was 19.7%. Female consultants received 16% of all lower awards in the 2007-2008 awards round (compared to 24.5% in 2006/2007). Overall female consultants hold 23.2 % of lower awards, giving a slight under representation of female consultants at the lower award level (27% of the consultant population are females) . Table 3 shows the analysis of lower awards by gender.

### ***Community Background***

8. An analysis of consultants who applied for an award shows that 46% declared themselves as coming from a Protestant community (PC) background, and 35.5% from a Roman Catholic community background (RCC). A survey of Trusts in 2007 showed that 48% of all consultants were from a PC background and 31.5% were from a RCC background (20% were either “not known” or from “neither PC or RCC background”). An analysis of the lower awards made shows that 44% of awards went to consultants declaring a PC background, 37.6% went to consultants declaring a RCC background, 8.8% to “neithers”, and 9.6% were “not knows”. Table 4 gives a breakdown of applications and awards made by community background.

### ***Ethnic Origin***

9. A survey of Trusts in 2007 indicates that 7% of all consultants are from the ethnic minority groupings. 6.4% of consultants (21 applications) who applied for lower awards declared themselves as coming from the smaller ethnic groups. A total of 8 lower awards (6.4%) went to consultants from ethnic minority groupings, which is the same proportion as applications received. It should be noted that the South Eastern Trust, who made 36 awards, was unable to provide any data on ethnic origin. Table 5 gives a breakdown of applications and awards made by ethnic origin.

**Pat Carvill**

**Chairman**

**Northern Ireland Clinical Excellence Awards Committee**

**ANNEX 1****LIST OF LOWER AWARDS GRANTED IN 2007/2008****STEP 9**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HSC EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Curran MG	Psychiatry- Learning Disability	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Damani NN	Pathology – Medical Microbiology	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Rollins MD	Paediatrics	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2007

**STEP 8**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HSC EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
El-Agnaf MR	Haematology-Blood	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
McAloon J	Paediatrics	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
McConnell JG	Geriatric Medicine	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Parker MJR	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Rocke LG	Accident & Emergency	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007

**STEP 7**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HSC EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Garrett PJ	General Medicine	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Harper R	General Medicine	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Harty J	Medicine-Nephrology	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Jack CIA	Geriatric Medicine	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Keane PF	Urology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
McMillen RM	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Moorehead RJ	General Surgery	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Morrow JI	Neurology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Power MJP	Geriatric Medicine	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Ryan MF	Pathology-Chemical	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Silvestri JG	Ophthalmology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Trinick TR	Pathology-Chemical	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007

## **STEP 6**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HSC EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Cooke RS	Neurosurgery	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Gleadhill ICL	General Medicine	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Hill DA	Anaesthetics	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Hughes DFC	Pathology-Histopathology	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Hunter EK	General Medicine	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Kearney MP	Pathology- Medical Microbiology	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Kelly CB	Psychiatry-Adult	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
McAllister C	Anaesthetics	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
McCance DR	General Medicine	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
McKinney MS	Anaesthetics	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
McNeill AJ	Cardiology	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Morrison PJ	Clinical Genetics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Murphy PP	Medicine-Gastroenterology	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Soong CV	General Surgery Special Interest Vascular Surgery	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Watson RGP	General Medicine	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Whitehead HM	General Medicine	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007

## **STEP 5**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HSC EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Brown JH	Nephrology (Renal)	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Carey D	Surgery Special Interest Oncological Surgery	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Carragher AM	General Surgery	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Carson D	Anaesthetics	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Conneally P	Radiology	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Cuthbert RJG	Pathology-Haematology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Fogarty PP	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007

**STEP 5** (cont'd)

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HSC EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Gaffney B	Public Health Medicine	Health Promotion Agency	01/04/2007
Hall SR	Radiology	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Heaney LG	Medicine – Respiratory	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Hussey DL	Restorative Dentistry	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Leyden PEF	Anaesthetics	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Love AM	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Mackle EJ	General Surgery	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Ramsay-Baggs P	Oral Surgery	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Simpson JA	Psychiatry-Adult	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Tham TCK	General Medicine	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Trinder TJ	Anaesthetics	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007

**STEP 4**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HSC EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Casey F	Paediatric Cardiology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Darling JR	Anaesthetics	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Dolan OM	Dermatology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Hamilton RA	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Hanley PD	Radiology	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Ingram RM	Psychiatry – Adult	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
McCloskey BV	Anaesthetics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
McCrory DC	General Surgery	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
McDougal NI	General Medicine	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
O'Neill FA	Psychiatry – Adult	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Stewart FJ	Clinical Genetics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Wright DG	Anaesthetics	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Wright RER	Radiology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007

### **STEP 3**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HSC EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Chisakuta AM	Anaesthetics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Clarke JI	Clinical Oncology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Convery RP	Medicine-Respiratory	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Eatock MM	Medical Oncology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Fogarty DG	Nephrology (Renal)	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Gardiner PV	Rheumatology	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Gaston C	Paediatrics	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Grace D	Anaesthetics	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Hart PMA	Ophthalmology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Herron JC	Nephrology (Renal)	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Hyland MA	Radiology	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Kennedy PT	Radiology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
McCarthy GJ	Anaesthetics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
O'Reilly SA	Accident and Emergency	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Ramsey JCP	Radiology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Sharkey R	Medicine – Respiratory	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Sharpe PC	Chemical Pathology	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Steele IC	Geriatric Medicine	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Weir CD	General Surgery	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Wiggam MI	Geriatric Medicine	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007

### **STEP 2**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HSC EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Aljarrad B	Paediatrics	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Bali S	Paediatrics	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Carson AC	Radiology	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2007

**STEP 2** (cont'd)

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HSC EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Downey P	General Surgery/Urology	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Hunter SJ	Endocrinology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Jenkins MG	Accident & Emergency	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Laverick MD	Orthopaedic & Traumatic Surgery	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Loughrey CBM	Radiology	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Loughrey CM	Chemical Pathology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
McAlinden MG	Orthopaedics	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
McClelland HR	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
McGovern SJ	Accident & Emergency	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
McKenna KE	Dermatology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
McKeown PP	Cardiology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Morris KG	Pathology- Haematology	NI Blood Transfusion Service Agency	01/04/2007
Renfrew CW	Anaesthetics	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Sweet DG	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Wallace RGH	Orthopaedic & Traumatic Surgery	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007

**STEP 1**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HSC EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Austin S	Anaesthetics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
English B	Psychiatry - Old Age	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Hughes DA	Anaesthetics	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Irwin CR	Restorative Dentistry	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Kennedy RJ	General Surgery	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Khsoravan K	General Surgery	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Loan WC	Radiology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
MacPherson JE	Psychiatry – Learning Disability	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007

**STEP 1** (cont'd)

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HSC EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
McCallion K	General Surgery	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
McCarthy A	Paediatrics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
McManus J	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Menowen IBA	Cardiology	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Moan MJ	General Medicine	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Mullally BH	Dental Medicine Specialties	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
O'Connor MG	Paediatrics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
O'Neill HF	Anaesthetics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Ong YL	Haematology	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Reid MA	Anaesthetics	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Russell JC	Anaesthetics	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Smyth A	General Medicine	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Smyth J	General Medicine	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Watkins DC	Paediatrics	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2007
Wilson A	Public Health Medicine	Eastern HSS Board	01/04/2007

**TABLE 1**

**OUTCOME OF LOWER CLINICAL EXCELLENCE AWARDS  
2007-2008**

Trust	Awards Round Completed	Date Report Received	Awards Made	Number of Applications Received	Number of Awards Made
Northern	Yes	December 2008	Yes	43	14
Southern	Yes	January 2009	Yes	39	15
Belfast	Yes	March 2008	Yes	156	51
South Eastern	Yes	August 2008	Yes	56	36
Western	Yes	October 2008	Yes	36	9

**TABLE 2**

**CONSULTANTS IN RECEIPT OF LOWER CLINICAL EXCELLENCE AWARDS / DISCRETIONARY POINTS**

CLINICAL EXCELLENCE AWARDS		DISCRETIONARY POINTS	
STEP 1	44	1	82
STEP 2	35	2	62
STEP 3	45	3	43
STEP 4	28	4	37
STEP 5	39	5	18
STEP 6	30	6	16
STEP 7	16	7	8
STEP 8	9	8	4
STEP 9	5		
TOTAL	251		270
GRAND TOTAL	521		

**NOTE:**

Number of consultants holding higher clinical excellence awards:- 104

Consultant population for 2007-2008:- 1190

**TABLE 3****ANALYSIS BY GENDER**

	Male		Female	
		%		%
<b>Applications Received</b>	<b>265</b>	<b>80.3</b>	<b>65</b>	<b>19.7</b>
<b>Awards Granted in 2007/2008</b>	<b>105</b>	<b>84</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>Consultants Holding Awards (Discretionary Points/Lower CEA's)</b>	<b>400</b>	<b>76.8</b>	<b>121</b>	<b>23.2</b>

**TABLE 4****ANALYSIS BY COMMUNITY BACKGROUND**

	PC		RCC		NEITHER		NOT KNOWN	
		%		%		%		%
<b>Applications Received</b>	<b>152</b>	<b>46</b>	<b>117</b>	<b>35.5</b>	<b>43</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>18</b>	<b>5.5</b>
<b>Awards Granted in 2007/2008</b>	<b>55</b>	<b>44</b>	<b>47</b>	<b>37.6</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>8.8</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>9.6</b>

**NOTE**

PC

consultants who declared themselves as members of the Protestant community.

RCC

consultants who declared themselves as members of the Roman Catholic community.

NEITHER

consultants who declared themselves as members of neither the Protestant nor the Roman Catholic community.

**TABLE 5****ANALYSIS BY ETHNIC ORIGIN**

	WHITE		NOT KNOWN		ETHNIC MINORITY	
		%		%		%
<b>Applications Received</b>	<b>231</b>	<b>70</b>	<b>22</b>	<b>6.6</b>	<b>21</b>	<b>6.4</b>
<b>Awards Granted in 2007/2008</b>	<b>75</b>	<b>60</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>4.8</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>6.4</b>

**NOTE**

This excludes the South Eastern Trust who received 56 applications and made 36 awards