



Department of  
**Health, Social Services  
and Public Safety**

---

An Roinn

**Sláinte, Seirbhísí Sóisialta  
agus Sábháilteachta Poiblí**

---

[www.dhsspsni.gov.uk](http://www.dhsspsni.gov.uk)

# **Northern Ireland Clinical Excellence Awards Committee**

## ***Annual Report 2006-2007***

## CONTENTS

	<b>Page</b>
Foreword	1
 <u>PART ONE</u>	
Report on the outcome of higher awards	3
List of higher awards granted in 2006–2007	10
Table 1:    Analysis by Specialty	11
Table 2:    Analysis by Gender	12
Table 3:    Analysis by Board Area	12
Table 4:    Analysis by Age	13
Table 5:    Analysis by Ethnic Origin	13
Table 6:    Analysis by Community Background	13
 <u>PART TWO</u>	
Report on the outcome of lower awards	14
List of lower awards granted in 2006-2007	16
Table 1:    Outcome of lower awards	22
Table 2:    Consultants in receipt of Lower Clinical Excellence Awards/Discretionary Points	23
Table 3:    Analysis by Gender	24
Table 4:    Analysis by Community Background	24
Table 5:    Analysis by Ethnic Origin	24
 <u>APPENDICES</u>	
Appendix A – Membership of NICEAC	25
Appendix B - List of distinction award holders in Northern Ireland	26
Appendix C – List of higher clinical excellence award holders in Northern Ireland	31

## FOREWORD

This is the second annual report of the Northern Ireland Clinical Excellence Awards Committee (NICEAC). The report covers the period 1 April 2006 to 31 March 2007. A new clinical excellence awards scheme was introduced by the Department in 2005, incorporating the old discretionary points and distinction awards into a single graduated scheme.

This year there was a reduction in the number of applications for higher awards due to a change in the eligibility threshold. Nevertheless, the process was highly competitive with 79 step 10 applicants competing for fourteen awards, and 12 step 12 applicants competing for three awards. The committee found its task of deciding which consultants should be recommended for awards an extremely difficult one, particularly given the large number of excellent consultants who had applied. However, the committee was unanimous in its final recommendations for awards.

Part One of this document reports on the work of the regional committee during 2006-2007 and analyses the distribution of higher awards across the consultant population. It also includes the list of names of the consultants recommended by the committee for higher clinical excellence awards in 2006-2007.

Part Two reports on the outcome of the local awards process and includes some analysis of the distribution of lower awards. Part Two also includes a list of the names of the consultants who received lower clinical excellence awards in 2006-2007.

The committee reported in last year's annual report (2005-2006) that it was very concerned to learn that 9 Trusts had decided not to make any local awards, citing insufficient funds. The rationale for the scheme is that it should operate consistently and continuously from local to regional level, and it is not possible for it to do this unless the appropriate foundations are laid at local level. I am pleased to report that there has been some improvement this year, but still 5 Trusts have decided not to make any local awards. There has also been an overall increase in the number of local awards. Nevertheless, there is scope for further improvement. I understand that the Department will be reviewing the funding system for local awards this year and we look forward to contributing to that review.

The committee carried out a review at the end of the second year of the scheme and made some recommendations to the Department for further refinements to the scheme, including a recommendation that the eligibility threshold for higher awards should be reduced (from five lower awards to four). The Department accepted all of the committee's recommendations and the changes will be introduced for the 2007-2008 awards round.

This year saw the departure of Deirdre Dorman as one of the employer representatives on the committee following the end of her term as Chair of Armagh and Dungannon Trust. I wish to express my sincere thanks to Mrs Dorman for her extremely valuable contribution to the work of the committee over the past two years.

I am grateful to the committee Medical Director, the committee members, and the secretariat for all their work and advice during the second year of the new scheme. I would also like to thank the senior award holders and the Trusts and other employers for the citations and recommendations which they made in respect of applicants for awards. The committee was grateful also to those consultants who offered comments and queries about the operation of the scheme. We attach a great deal of importance to a continuing dialogue with consultants, and it has been very helpful to us to have had frank and candid comments from a range of actual and potential candidates.

**Pat Carvill**  
**Chairman**  
**Northern Ireland Clinical Excellence Awards Committee**

# **PART ONE**

## **REPORT ON THE OUTCOME OF HIGHER AWARDS**

### **Introduction**

1. This is the second annual report of the Northern Ireland Clinical Excellence Awards Committee (NICEAC) and covers the 2006-2007 awards round. The new clinical excellence awards scheme was introduced in 2005. The new scheme combines the discretionary points and distinction awards into a single graduated scheme. The scheme is governed by common assessment criteria with standard forms for all levels of awards. Lower awards (steps 1-9) are decided by local Trust committees. Higher awards (steps 10-12) are recommended by the regional committee (NICEAC).
2. The committee's remit is to recommend to the Department which medical and dental consultants should receive higher clinical excellence awards, and also to monitor and quality assure the outworkings of the local awards process. The committee, in making its recommendations, must have regard to the number of awards available for allocation. The Department is responsible for determining the number of higher awards that should be made available.
3. The rationale of the Northern Ireland clinical excellence awards scheme, as set out in the Guide to the scheme, is to "reward exceptional personal contributions made by individual consultants (above the normal expectations of a postholder) to the delivery of high quality care to patients and to the continuous improvement of Health and Social Care (HSC)."

### **Membership of NICEAC**

4. The committee is constituted as follows: a lay chairman, a vice chair (medical director), two HPSS medical/dental members; two HPSS employer members, one lay member, and two GB medical/dental members. There is currently one GB medical/dental member vacancy. An independent external observer with a background in HR is present at committee meetings as an advisor on procedural aspects.
5. The membership of the committee for the 2006-2007 awards round is set out at Appendix A.

### **2006-2007 Awards Round**

6. The awards round commenced in April 2006 and was completed in February 2007. The committee invited self nominations from all eligible HPSS consultants in June and a total of 91 applications were received. There were 79 applications for step 10 awards, and 12 for step 12 awards. There were 14 step 10 awards and

3 step 12 awards available for allocation. No applications were invited for step 11 awards, although it was open to the committee to recommend a step 11 award if it considered that a particular step 10 application merited it.

7. Because the awards process was extremely competitive, it was inevitable that a considerable number of excellent consultants failed to be recommended for an award, and the committee wishes to place on record its appreciation of the very high standard of performance that was apparent in many of the applications which on this occasion were unsuccessful.
8. The committee awarded a score for each of the four criteria: delivering a high quality service; developing a high quality service; managing a high quality service; and research, teaching and training, taking into account the information contained in the CV forms and the citation forms. All four criteria were equally weighted. The committee in deciding what score to award, looked for specific evidence of performance or achievements which could be regarded as over and above what would normally be expected of a consultant in a particular post. In order to achieve a high score in a particular criterion a consultant needed to demonstrate clear evidence of particularly outstanding performance in relation to the attributes covered by that criterion (details of the attributes required for each criterion are contained in Section 5 of the Guide to the Scheme).
9. The Chair and each of the 7 panel members independently scored each of the four criteria, awarding marks in the range 0-12, with 12 being the best. These scores were aggregated, and the resulting scores and consequent rank ordering were then considered and discussed by the committee as a whole at a meeting in January 2007. Scores were set for each of the 79 step 10 applications and a shortlisting cut off score was agreed. A total of 26 applications were shortlisted. Following the meeting in January members were allowed time to reflect on their initial scores for the shortlisted applications in the light of discussion at the meeting, and where they considered it appropriate members were free to amend their scoring. The revised scores were again aggregated, and were the subject of discussion by the full Committee on a second occasion, in February 2007. Following challenge and review final scores were agreed for each of the shortlisted candidates and there was unanimous agreement on the 14 highest scores who were the successful candidates. Similar consideration was given to the step 12 applications, and there was unanimous agreement on the highest step 12 scores. The names of the successful step 10 and step 12 consultants are listed at the end of Part One of this report. A full list of all consultants in Northern Ireland holding distinction awards and higher clinical excellence awards can be found at Appendices B and C. The committee did not recommend any step 11 awards.
10. In February 2007 the committee visited the Critical Care Unit and Respiratory Medicine Ward at Altnagelvin Area Hospital. The committee was most impressed by the developments at these sites and was grateful for the warm welcome they received. Consultants from the Western Board area were given the opportunity of questioning committee members about the awards scheme.

## **Five Year Reviews**

11. Higher clinical excellence awards and distinction awards are subject to review every five years. Trusts are required to establish a mechanism to review local awards every five years. The five year review process is important to ensure that consultants in receipt of awards continue to meet the criteria for awards. The committee can withdraw or downgrade an award if it believes an individual consultant does not continue to fulfil the criteria.
12. A total of 15 distinction awards were subject to review in this awards round. The committee Chairman and Medical Director carefully considered the CV forms and the citation forms received from employers relating to each consultant and reported their findings to the full committee at its meeting in February. The committee recommended that all 15 awards should continue for a further five years.

## **Feedback**

13. A consultant who has applied for a higher clinical excellence award and is dissatisfied with the committee's decision has the right of appeal to an independent appeals panel. An appeals panel will only consider the process by which the committee arrived at its decision; it will not consider whether an award should or should not have been made. A consultant must, in the first instance, request written feedback from the Chairman of NICEAC. Following the allocation of awards for 2006-2007, 29 consultants (3 step 12s and 26 step 10s) requested feedback and received a written response from the Chairman. Two of those consultants (1 step 12 and 1 step 10) received further feedback at a meeting with the NICEAC Chairman and Medical Director. There were no formal appeals to an independent appeals panel.

## **Review of second year**

14. A review of the scheme was carried out at the end of the 2006-2007 awards round to consider what further improvements could be made to the process. In light of that review some refinements have been made. The most important is that the eligibility threshold for higher awards has been reduced from five to four lower awards to help improve overall access to the scheme. This change, along with some other minor changes to the Guide and the forms, will be introduced for the 2007-2008 awards round. This change was in response to a number of comments from consultants who did not have the five local awards which were required as a condition of eligibility in 2006-2007. The committee continues to believe that it would be wrong to have a completely open access scheme for applicants for regional level awards, and that it is necessary to have a reasonably high eligibility threshold both in order to reflect the underlying rationale of the overall awards scheme as a whole and, realistically, to reflect the very limited number of regional awards available in any one year. However, it was evident that a good many

consultants felt strongly that the 2006-2007 threshold had been set at too high a level, and the committee accepted that a degree of wider access would be appropriate. This aspect of the scheme will be kept under review in the light of experience at regional level and of developments in the outworkings of the scheme at local level.

## **Distribution of Awards**

15. The committee monitors the distribution of higher awards in six areas: specialty, gender, Board area, age, ethnic origin and community background. The purpose of monitoring the outcome of awards is to identify, and if necessary permit the examination of reasons for, any imbalances in the distribution of awards. However, it must be emphasised that awards are granted to individuals solely on the grounds of merit. The committee does not discriminate in favour of, or against, any particular group. It is highly unlikely in a competitive process such as this (and given the small number of awards available annually) that there will be an equal proportion of awards between the various groups. Nevertheless, the monitoring process is extremely important; it is essential that any imbalances are identified and that the reasons for those imbalances are fully examined.
16. As mentioned above a total of 17 awards were made (3 step 12s and 14 step 10s). The 3 step 12 awards were allocated to existing A distinction award holders. All those with a minimum of five discretionary points were eligible to apply for a step 10 award. The successful candidates for the 14 step 10 awards were existing B distinction award holders, although it should be noted that the committee does not impose any specific requirement on the level of any pre-existing award once a consultant is eligible to apply.

### ***Specialty***

17. There are variations in the distribution of awards across the range of specialties (see Table 1). For this awards round there was a reasonable spread of awards across specialties with a total of nine specialties receiving at least one award. Most awards went to general medicine (4 awards) and anaesthetics (3 awards). An analysis of the overall distribution of awards following the 2006-2007 awards round shows that specialties such as psychiatry, orthopaedics and radiology continue to have a lower proportion of awards. Psychiatry and radiology did receive one award each this year, although no awards went to orthopaedics. The overall proportion of award holders in radiology has reduced further as oncology is now considered separately from radiology.

### ***Gender***

18. This year the proportion of female consultants applying for an award was down on last year. 9.9% of all applicants were female compared to 16.2% last year. While there was a decrease in the number of female applicants this year, two

female consultants received awards (the same as last year) representing 11.8% of all awards (see Table 2). The proportion of higher awards held by female consultants has increased slightly, 11.9% (from 11.7% last year). However, there still remains a significant under representation of female consultants at the higher award level given that female consultants represent 27% of the consultant population. The committee would continue to welcome more self nominations from female consultants.

### ***Board Areas***

19. Table 3 gives a breakdown of the number of applications and awards granted by Board area. The Eastern Board area contains about 62% of the total consultant population, but holds 81.7% of all awards. The Eastern Board area holds 72% of all B awards (Western Board 15%, Southern Board 9%, and Northern Board 4%). In this awards round 81.3% of all applicants were from Eastern Board Trusts and 94.1% of available awards went to consultants in the Eastern Board area. The Western Board area received 5.9% of available awards (1 award). No awards went to consultants in the Northern and Southern Board areas. There remains an imbalance in the geographical distribution of awards. However, it is perhaps not surprising that the greatest proportion of applicants should come from the larger hospitals (particularly those providing regional specialties) and Queen's University, which are located in the Eastern Board area.

### ***Age***

20. The average age of those consultants who received an award in 2006-2007 was 53 for step 10 awards (up slightly on last year when it was 51) and 54 for step 12 awards (see Table 4). It is to be expected that higher award holders will tend to be older, given the experience and length of time needed to achieve the very high standards required. However, it is noteworthy that one step 10 and one step 12 award were granted to consultants in the 45 - 49 age bands, an indication that the scheme is able to recognise the achievements of outstanding younger consultants.

### ***Ethnic Origin***

21. Out of the 91 applications received, no data was provided on ethnic origin on five of those applications. 3.3% of consultants who applied for an award (3 applications) declared themselves as coming from the minority ethnic groups (see Table 5). None of the available awards went to consultants from the smaller ethnic groups. We do not hold data on the ethnic origin of all consultants holding higher awards. However, the evidence suggests an under representation of consultants from the smaller ethnic groups at the higher award level. The committee would welcome more applications from eligible consultants in these groups. A survey of Trusts in 2007 indicates that 7% of all consultants are from the ethnic minority groupings (it should be noted that four Trusts were unable to provide data on ethnic origin).

## *Community Background*

22. Most consultants provided the relevant information on community background on the monitoring form. An analysis of those who applied for an award shows that 59.3% declared themselves as coming from a Protestant community (PC) background, 24.2% from a Roman Catholic community (RCC) background, 13.2% from “neither” a PC nor a RCC background and 3.3% were “not knowns” (see Table 6). A survey of Trusts, conducted by the Department in 2007, on the consultant population indicates that 48% of consultants have declared a PC background, 31.5% a RCC background, 9.5% neither a PC nor a RCC background, and 11% were “not knowns”. The proportion of applications from consultants declaring a RCC background was thus below the proportion of consultants from a RCC background in the consultant population as a whole.
23. An analysis of the awards made in this round shows that 10 awards went to consultants who had declared a PC background, 4 awards went to consultants who had declared a RCC background, 1 award went to a consultant who had declared himself as coming from neither a PC nor a RCC background, and 2 awards were “not knowns” (see Table 6). The proportion of awards going to consultants who had declared a RCC background (23.5%) reflects almost exactly the corresponding proportion of applicants, and is a marked increase on last year when it was 11.1% (one award). The committee was encouraged to see a more equitable outcome this year, but would continue to welcome more self nominations from consultants declaring a RCC background.
24. We do not hold data on the community background of all consultants holding higher awards. However, the data held suggests an under representation of consultants declaring a RCC background at the higher award level. One possible factor which may be affecting the position is that there appears to be a differential age profile between PC and RCC consultants. A survey carried out in 2007 suggested that 24% of consultants who declared a RCC background were over 51 years of age, compared with 37% of consultants who declared a PC background. Given that the average age of the successful consultants in this year’s awards round was 54, and that in general it will be consultants with a longer career history who are more likely to be able to offer the evidence of high achievement that is looked for in making awards, this may be part of the explanation for the imbalance.
25. The committee remains committed to the principle of awards being made purely on the basis of individual merit. Information on the community background of applicants is not, of course, made available to committee members, and scoring is conducted without regard to this factor. We recognise that with such small numbers of awards, year to year fluctuations in this area may be inevitable: even a single award can make a significant difference to the respective success rates. However, we will continue to closely monitor the outcomes of awards in order to identify general trends, and will continue to seek to identify and to examine the reasons for any imbalances.

## **Further Information**

26. Further information about the scheme or additional copies of the guide or the annual report can be obtained by contacting the NICEAC secretariat either by telephone (028 905 22869) or by writing to the NICEAC secretariat at Room D1, Castle Buildings, Upper Newtownards Road, Belfast, BT4 3SJ. The Guide and the annual report are also available on the Department's website [www.dhsspsni.gov.uk/](http://www.dhsspsni.gov.uk/) (health and social care/clinical excellence awards scheme).

## LIST OF HIGHER AWARDS GRANTED IN 2006-2007

The following consultants employed by the HPSS in Northern Ireland were granted clinical excellence awards in 2006-2007.

### **STEP 12**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HPSS EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Doherty CC	Nephrology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Hay RJ	Dermatology	The Queen's University	01/04/2006
Johnston PG	Medical Oncology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006

### **STEP 10**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HPSS EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Bell PM	General Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Beringer TRO	Geriatric Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Daly JG	Respiratory Medicine	Altnagelvin Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Dornan JC	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Farling PA	Anaesthetics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Fullerton KJ	Geriatric Medicine	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Hicks EM	Paediatrics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Houston RF	Clinical Oncology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Irwin ST	General Surgery	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Johnston JR	Anaesthetics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Johnston LC	Radiology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Lavery GG	Anaesthetics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Maxwell AP	Nephrology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Patterson DG	Psychiatry-Adult	North & West Belfast HSS Trust	01/04/2006

**TABLE 1**

**ANALYSIS BY SPECIALTY AT 1 APRIL 2006 (2006-2007 AWARDS ROUND)**

SPECIALTY	CONSULTANTS WHO APPLIED FOR AN AWARD 2006/2007		CONSULTANTS WHO RECEIVED AWARDS 2006/2007		CONSULTANTS HOLDING AWARDS		DISTRIBUTION OF AWARDS BY GRADE						
	No	% of consultant body	No	% of self nominations	No	% of available awards	No	% of overall awards	A+	A	B	Step 12	Step 10
Anaesthetics	176	15.6%	11	12.1%	3	17.6%	14	12.8%	1	5	5	-	3
ENT	22	2.0%	1	1.1%	-	-	4	3.7%	-	1	3	-	-
General Medicine & Allied Specialties (1)	225	20%	25	27.8%	5	29.4%	26	23.9%	2	7	12	2	3
Geriatric Medicine	35	3.1%	8	8.8%	2	11.8%	7	6.4%	1		5		2
Mental Illness (2)	114	10.1%	8	8.8%	1	5.9%	6	5.5%	1	2	2	-	1
Obs & Gynae	65	5.8%	4	4.4%	1	5.9%	5	4.6%	-	1	2	-	2
Ophthalmology	26	2.3%	1	1.1%	-	-	2	1.8%	-	-	2	-	-
Orthopaedics	40	3.6%	1	1.1%	-	-	2	1.8%	-	-	2	-	-
Paediatrics	75	6.7%	5	5.5%	1	5.9%	10	9.2%	-	2	5	1	2
Pathology (3)	80	7.1%	5	5.5%	-	-	7	6.4%	1	1	-	-	5
Public Health Medicine (4)	34	3.0%	2	2.2%	-	-	6	5.5%	-	1	4	-	1
Radiology	83	7.4%	5	5.5%	1	5.9%	1	1.0%	-	-	-	-	1
Oncology (5)	24	2.1%	2	2.2%	2	11.8%	3	2.8%	-	-	1	1	1
Surgery (6)	102	9.1%	9	9.9%	1	5.9%	11	10.1%	-	1	9	-	1
Dental Specialties (7)	25	2.2%	4	4.4%	-	-	4	3.7%	-	1	3	-	-
<b>TOTALS</b>	<b>1126</b>		<b>91</b>		<b>17</b>		<b>109</b>		<b>6</b>	<b>22</b>	<b>55</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>22</b>

**NOTES**

- (1) GENERAL MEDICINE & ALLIED SPECIALTIES - Anatomy, Accident & Emergency, Cardiology, Clinical Neuro-Physiology, Clinical Genetics, Clinical Pharmacology, Dermatology, Endocrinology and Diabetes, General Medicine, Genito-Urinary Medicine, Infectious Diseases, Nephrology, Neurology, Physiology, Rheumatology, Rehabilitation Medicine, Sports Medicine.
- (2) MENTAL ILLNESS - Child & Adolescent Psychiatry, Forensic Psychiatry, Mental Handicap, Mental Illness, Psychiatry of Old Age, Psychotherapy.
- (3) PATHOLOGY - Chemical Pathology, General Pathology, Haematology & Blood Transfusion, Histology, Histopathology, Immuno-Pathology, Medical Microbiology, Neuropathology.
- (4) PUBLIC HEALTH MEDICINE - Occupational Medicine, Public Health Medicine.
- (5) ONCOLOGY - Clinical Oncology, Medical Oncology.
- (6) SURGERY - Cardiothoracic Surgery, General Surgery, Neurosurgery, Paediatric Surgery, Plastic Surgery, Urology.
- (7) DENTAL SPECIALTIES - Dental Anatomy, Dental Prosthetics, Oral Surgery, Paediatric & Preventative Dentistry, Periodontics, Restorative Dentistry, Orthodontics

**TABLE 2****ANALYSIS BY GENDER**

	Male		Female	
		%		%
<b>SELF NOMINATIONS RECEIVED</b>	<b>82</b>	<b>90.1</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>9.9</b>
<b>CONSULTANTS HOLDING AWARDS (DISTINCTION AWARDS/HIGHER CEA'S)</b>	<b>96</b>	<b>88.1</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>11.9</b>
<b>AWARDS GRANTED IN 2006/2007</b>	<b>15</b>	<b>88.2</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>11.8</b>

**TABLE 3****ANALYSIS BY BOARD AREA**

	<b>NORTHERN</b>	<b>SOUTHERN</b>	<b>EASTERN</b>	<b>WESTERN</b>
<b>NUMBER OF CONSULTANTS</b>	<b>147</b>	<b>131</b>	<b>706</b>	<b>142</b>
<b>%</b>	<b>13.1</b>	<b>11.6</b>	<b>62.7</b>	<b>12.6</b>
<b>NUMBER OF SELF NOMINATIONS</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>74</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>%</b>	<b>7.7</b>	<b>1.1</b>	<b>81.3</b>	<b>9.9</b>
<b>AWARDS GRANTED</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>%</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>94.1</b>	<b>5.9</b>
<b>NUMBER OF TOTAL AWARDS PER AREA</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>89</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>% OF TOTAL AWARDS (out of 109)</b>	<b>3.7</b>	<b>4.6</b>	<b>81.7</b>	<b>10.1</b>

**TABLE 4****ANALYSIS OF NEW AWARDS BY AGE**

AGE GROUP	NEW AWARDS	
	Step 12	Step 10
35-39	-	-
40-44	-	-
45-49	1	1
50-54	-	8
55-59	2	5
60-64	-	-
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>AVERAGE AGE</b>	<b>54</b>	<b>53</b>

**TABLE 5****ANALYSIS BY ETHNIC ORIGIN**

	WHITE		NOT KNOWN		ETHNIC MINORITY	
		%		%		%
<b>SELF NOMINATIONS RECEIVED</b>	83	91.2	5	5.5	3	3.3
<b>AWARDS GRANTED 2006/2007</b>	17	100	-	-	-	-

**TABLE 6****ANALYSIS BY COMMUNITY BACKGROUND**

	PC		RCC		NEITHER		NOT KNOWN	
		%		%		%		%
<b>SELF NOMINATIONS RECEIVED</b>	54	59.3	22	24.2	12	13.2	3	3.3
<b>AWARDS GRANTED 2006/2007</b>	10	58.8	4	23.5	1	5.9	2	11.8

NOTE:

PC –

consultants who declared themselves as members of the Protestant community.

RCC -

consultants who declared themselves as members of the Roman Catholic community.

NEITHER -

consultants who declared themselves as members of neither the Protestant nor the Roman Catholic community.

## **PART TWO**

### **REPORT ON THE OUTCOME OF LOWER AWARDS**

1. The committee has a monitoring and quality assurance role over the lower awards process. Trusts are required to report annually to the committee on the outcome of the local process, providing details of the composition of the local panel, the names of the successful consultants, and a breakdown of the awards made by the various groupings. Trusts must also demonstrate that the local process has been completed fairly and in accordance with the guidance issued by the Department.

#### **Results of Monitoring 2006/2007**

2. In March 2007 all eighteen Trusts were asked to complete a proforma detailing the outcome of their local process. Sixteen Trusts advised that they had completed the local awards round. Five of those Trusts did not make any local awards, stating that they had no discretionary points to recycle or insufficient funds. Eleven Trusts made a total of 110 local awards. This was a considerable increase on last year when seven Trusts made a total of 71 awards. One consultant received 3 awards, five consultants received 2 awards and the remaining consultants each received one award. Table 1 shows the outcome of the local process for each Trust. The names of the successful consultants and the current level of award held are listed at the end of Part Two.
3. The two remaining Trusts (Craigavon and Banbridge, and the Mater) have advised that their local committees will be meeting later this year and that the relevant information will be forwarded in due course. All Trusts should be attempting to meet and make decisions on local awards within the relevant awards round, and the committee is concerned that these particular Trusts did not meet within the awards round.

#### **Results of Monitoring for Outstanding 2005/2006 Awards**

4. At the last monitoring round two Trusts had not met to decide on local awards. These Trusts (Greenpark and South & East Belfast) have since met and awarded 5 and 4 awards respectively for the 2005-2006 year. Homefirst and Belfast City Hospital Trusts were reported in the 2005-2006 awards round as not having made any local awards. They have, however, subsequently made 3 and one award respectively for the 2005-2006 year.

#### **Distribution of Lower Awards**

5. Last year we were unable to carry out any analysis on the distribution of lower awards due to a lack of data received from Trusts. This year we have been able to carry out some analysis of the distribution of awards by gender, community background, and ethnic origin. We have been able to analyse the distribution of awards by community background and ethnic origin, in terms of applications and

awards made. However, we do not hold sufficient data on the overall breakdown of existing lower award holders by community background and ethnic origin. The total number of consultants now in receipt of a lower clinical excellence award/discretionary point is 523 (168 lower CEAs, 355 discretionary points). Details of the numbers of consultants in receipt of each lower award/discretionary point is shown in Table 2.

### ***Gender***

6. The proportion of female consultants applying for a lower award was 18.4%. Female consultants received 24.5% of all lower awards in the 2006-2007 awards round. This proportion is broadly comparable to the proportion of female consultants in the population as a whole (27%). Overall female consultants hold 23.3% of all lower awards. This represents a slight under representation of female consultants at the lower award level, although it is an improvement on the proportion of female consultants holding awards at the higher level. Table 3 shows the analysis of lower awards by gender.

### ***Community Background***

7. An analysis of consultants who applied for an award shows that 47.4% declared themselves as coming from a Protestant community (PC) background, and 32.1% from a Roman Catholic community background (RCC). It should be noted that data on the community background of 60 applications is not known (out of a total of 293). The proportions of RCC and PC applications is broadly similar to the proportions in the consultant population (31.5% and 48% respectively). An analysis of the lower awards made shows that 41.8% of awards went to consultants declaring a PC background, 35.5% went to consultants declaring a RCC background, 2.7% to “neithers”, and 14.5% were “not knowns” (see Table 4). One Trust, who made 6 awards, was unable to provide any data on community background. Consultants declaring a PC background received a slightly lower distribution of awards compared to their proportion in the consultant population, whereas consultants declaring a RCC background received a slightly higher share.

### ***Ethnic Origin***

8. A survey of Trusts in 2007 indicates that 7% of all consultants are from the ethnic minority groupings. 3.8% of consultants (11 applications) who applied for lower awards declared themselves as coming from the smaller ethnic groups. A total of 8 lower awards (7.3%) went to consultants from ethnic minority groupings, which is a high success rate given that only 11 applications were received. It should be noted that two Trusts (making 22 awards) were unable to provide any data on ethnic origin. Table 5 gives a breakdown of applications and awards made by ethnic origin.

**LIST OF LOWER AWARDS GRANTED IN 2006-2007****STEP 9**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HPSS EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Archbold JAA	General Surgery	Down Lisburn HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Browne FWA	Psychiatry- Forensic	South & East Belfast HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Finnegan OC	General Medicine	Causeway HSS Trust	01/04/2006

**STEP 8**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HPSS EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Curran MG	Psychiatry – Learning Disability	Foyle HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Damani NN	Pathology-Medical Microbiology	Craigavon Area Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Fleming B	Psychiatry-Adult	Down Lisburn HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Gilmore P	General Medicine	Causeway HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Higginson JDS	Cardiology	Ulster Community & Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Nesbitt GA	Anaesthetics	Altnagelvin Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Rollins M	Paediatrics	Causeway HSS Trust	01/04/2006

**STEP 7**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HPSS EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
El-Agnaf MR	Haematology/Blood Transfusion	Ulster Community & Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Fitzpatrick KT	Anaesthetics	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
McCleane GJ	Anaesthetics	Down Lisburn HSS Trust	01/04/2006
O’Kane MJ	Pathology-Chemical	Altnagelvin Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006

**STEP 6**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HPSS EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Ashe R	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	United HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Cassidy C E	Psychiatry – Addictions	Armagh and Dungannon HSS Trust	01/04/2006

**STEP 6** (cont'd)

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HPSS EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Harper R	General Medicine	Ulster Community & Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Keane PF	Urology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
McCafferty FG	Psychiatry – Old Age	South & East Belfast HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Monaghan CE	Psychiatry – Adult	Armagh and Dungannon HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Rea SM	Psychiatry – Old Age	Foyle HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Richardson SG	Cardiology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Ryan M	Chemical Pathology	United HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Trinick TR	Pathology-Chemical	Ulster Community & Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Varghese A	General Medicine	Causeway HSS Trust	01/04/2006

**STEP 5**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HPSS EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Allen DC	Histopathology/Cytopathology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Bell P	Psychiatry – Adult	South & East Belfast HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Brown MG	General Surgery	Causeway HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Cooper A	Anaesthetics	Causeway HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Hill AE	Paediatrics	South & East Belfast HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Hill DA	Anaesthetics	Ulster Community & Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Johnston BT	General Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Kearney M	Microbiology	United HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Kelly CB	Psychiatry-Adult	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
McAleer JJ	Radiotherapy	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
McAllister C	Anaesthetics	Craigavon Area Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006
McKinney LA	Accident and Emergency	Altnagelvin Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006

**STEP 5** (cont'd)

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HPSS EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
McKinney MS	Anaesthetics	Ulster Community & Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006
McNeill AJ	Cardiology	Altnagelvin Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006
McNulty JE	Radiology	Down Lisburn HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Morrison PJ	Clinical Genetics	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Murphy PP	Gastroenterology	Craigavon Area Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Murray AP	Psychiatry – Child and Adolescent	Foyle HSS Trust	01/04/2006
O'Neill M	Anaesthetics	United HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Ritchie CM	General Medicine	Craigavon Area Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Soong CV	General Surgery Special Interest Vascular Surgery	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Tracey F	General Medicine	Causeway HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Trouton T	Cardiology	United HSS Trust	01/04/2006

**STEP 4**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HPSS EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Carson D	Anaesthetics	Ulster Community & Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Cuthbert RJG	Pathology-Haematology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Doherty MM	Psychiatry-Adult	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Heaney LG	Medicine-Respiratory	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Ledwith M	Paediatrics	Causeway HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Leyden P	Anaesthetics	United HSS Trust	01/04/2006
MacLeod C	Paediatrics	United HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Marshall BM	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Causeway HSS Trust	01/04/2006
McKane WR	General Medicine	Ulster Community & Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Price JH	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Smith MBH	Paediatrics	Craigavon Area Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006

**STEP 4** (cont'd)

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HPSS EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Tham T	General Medicine	Ulster Community & Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Tubman TRJ	Paediatrics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Wright GD	Rheumatology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006

**STEP 3**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HPSS EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Best RM	Ophthalmology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Campbell WJ	General Surgery	Ulster Community & Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Chada N	Psychiatry	Armagh and Dungannon HSS Trust	01/04/2006
DeJode M	Radiology	Causeway HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Hutton SEM	Paediatrics	Foyle HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Kirk SE	Psychiatry	Causeway HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Loughery AC	Pathology-Medical Microbiology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Martyn CJ	Accident & Emergency	Ulster Community & Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006
McDonnell CM	Psychiatry-Adult	Foyle HSS Trust	01/04/2006
McGarvey L	General Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
McGuinness JF	Psychiatry-Learning Disability	Armagh and Dungannon HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Scally C	ENT	United HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Thompson G	Anaesthetics	Down Lisburn HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Wright DG	Anaesthetics	Causeway HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Young MRA	Urology	Craigavon Area Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006

## **STEP 2**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HPSS EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Convery RP	Medicine-Respiratory	Craigavon Area Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Eatock MM	Medical Oncology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Graham A	Cardiothoracic Surgery	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Harding TAC	General Medicine	Down Lisburn HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Harron J	Nephrology	United HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Kernohan R	Urology	Causeway HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Leeman T	Psychiatry	Causeway HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Lynch JV	Psychiatry	South & East Belfast HSS Trust	01/04/2006
McAlinden PM	Paediatrics	Armagh and Dungannon HSS Trust	01/04/2006
McGlennon DM	Psychiatry-Child & Adolescent	Foyle HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Rodgers C	General Medicine	United HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Sharkey R	General Medicine	Altnagelvin Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Symington M	Anaesthetics	Causeway HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Wiggam MI	Geriatric Medicine	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Wilson RH	Medical Oncology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006

## **STEP 1**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HPSS EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Bailie CA	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Bali S	Paediatrics	United HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Deyermond RE	Anaesthetics	Ulster Community & Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Downey P	Urology	Causeway HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Gamble R	Occupational Health	Foyle HSS Trust	01/04/2006

**STEP 1** (cont'd)

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HPSS EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Garvey A	Medical Oncology	Altnagelvin Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Hunter SJ	Endocrinology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Jack CIA	Geriatric Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Morris KG	Pathology Haematology	NI Blood Transfusion Service	01/04/2006
O'Sullivan J	Medical Oncology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Sweet DG	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Trimble M	Acute Medicine	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006

**TABLE 1****OUTCOME OF LOWER CLINICAL EXCELLENCE AWARDS****2006-2007**

<b>Trust</b>	<b>Awards Round Completed</b>	<b>Awards Made</b>	<b>Number Applications Received</b>	<b>Number Awards Made</b>
<b>Altnagelvin</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>22</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>Armagh and Dungannon</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>Belfast City</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>62</b>	<b>18</b>
<b>Causeway</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>17</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>Craigavon Area</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>24</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>Down Lisburn</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>Foyle</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>Royal Group</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>76</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>South and East Belfast</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>United</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>25</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>Ulster Community</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>34</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>Greenpark</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>-</b>
<b>Homefirst</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>-</b>
<b>Newry and Mourne</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>-</b>
<b>North and West Belfast</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>-</b>
<b>Sperrin/Lakeland</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>-</b>
<b>Craigavon and Banbridge</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>-</b>
<b>Mater</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>-</b>
<b>Total</b>			<b>289</b>	<b>110</b>

**TABLE 2****CONSULTANTS IN RECEIPT OF LOWER CLINICAL EXCELLENCE AWARDS / DISCRETIONARY POINTS**

<b>CLINICAL EXCELLENCE AWARDS</b>		<b>DISCRETIONARY POINTS</b>	
<b>STEP 1</b>	<b>28</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>95</b>
<b>STEP 2</b>	<b>24</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>80</b>
<b>STEP 3</b>	<b>26</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>59</b>
<b>STEP 4</b>	<b>21</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>52</b>
<b>STEP 5</b>	<b>31</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>30</b>
<b>STEP 6</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>23</b>
<b>STEP 7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>STEP 8</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>STEP 9</b>	<b>3</b>		
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>168</b>		<b>355</b>
<b>GRAND TOTAL</b>	<b>523</b>		

**TABLE 3****ANALYSIS BY GENDER**

	Male		Female	
		%		%
<b>Applications Received</b>	<b>239</b>	<b>81.6</b>	<b>54</b>	<b>18.4</b>
<b>Awards Granted in 2006/2007</b>	<b>83</b>	<b>75.5</b>	<b>27</b>	<b>24.5</b>
<b>Consultants Holding Awards (Discretionary Points/Lower CEA's)</b>	<b>401</b>	<b>76.7</b>	<b>122</b>	<b>23.3</b>

**TABLE 4****ANALYSIS BY COMMUNITY BACKGROUND**

	PC		RCC		NEITHER		NOT KNOWN	
		%		%		%		%
<b>Applications Received</b>	<b>139</b>	<b>47.4</b>	<b>94</b>	<b>32.1</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>-</b>	<b>60</b>	<b>20.5</b>
<b>Awards Granted in 2006/2007</b>	<b>46</b>	<b>41.8</b>	<b>39</b>	<b>35.5</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>2.7</b>	<b>22</b>	<b>20.0</b>

**NOTE**

PC

consultants who declared themselves as members of the Protestant community.

RCC

consultants who declared themselves as members of the Roman Catholic community.

NEITHER

consultants who declared themselves as members of neither the Protestant nor the Roman Catholic community.

**TABLE 5****ANALYSIS BY ETHNIC ORIGIN**

	WHITE		NOT KNOWN		ETHNIC MINORITY	
		%		%		%
<b>Applications Received</b>	<b>265</b>	<b>90.4</b>	<b>17</b>	<b>5.8</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>3.8</b>
<b>Awards Granted in 2006/2007</b>	<b>77</b>	<b>70</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>2.7</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>7.3</b>

## APPENDIX A

### NORTHERN IRELAND CLINICAL EXCELLENCE AWARDS COMMITTEE

#### MEMBERSHIP 2006-2007 AWARDS ROUND

##### **CHAIRMAN**

Mr Patrick Carvill

Retired permanent secretary from the Department of Education (1990-1998) and from the Department of Finance and Personnel (1998-2003).

##### **MEDICAL DIRECTOR**

Professor Robert W Stout

Director of Research and Development for the HPSS, Professor of Geriatric Medicine at Queen's University Belfast and consultant physician at Belfast City Hospital.

##### **MEMBERS**

Dr Ian W Carson

Chairman of the Regulation and Quality Improvement Authority, a former Deputy Chief Medical Officer and former consultant anaesthetist at the Royal Group of Hospitals HSS Trust.

Professor Alan Crockard

National Director, Modernising Medical Careers, Department of Health. Professor of Surgical Neurology (Personal Chair), Institute of Neurology and The National Hospital for Neurology and Neurosurgery, University College London Hospitals NHS Trust.

Mrs Deirdre Dorman

Chairman of Armagh Dungannon HSS Trust since September 2003.

Mrs Diane Drennan

Solicitor working in the Northern Ireland Law Commission.

Dr Curly Morris

Consultant Haematologist in Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust and Deputy Director, Belfast Link Laboratories.

Mrs Elaine Way

Chief Executive Western Health and Social Care Trust and Past President of The Association of Healthcare Human Resources Management

**DISTINCTION AWARD HOLDERS IN NORTHERN IRELAND****A+ AWARD HOLDERS**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HPSS EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Adgey A A J	Cardiology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	02/01/2000
Atkinson A B	Medicine/ Endocrinology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2003
McClelland R J	Psychiatry - Adult	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	10/09/2003
Mirakhur R K	Anaesthetics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2001
Morris T C M	Pathology/Haematology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/11/2003
Stout R W	Geriatric Medicine	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/02/2000

## A AWARD HOLDERS

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HPSS EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Boyle D D	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2003
Callender M E	General Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2003
Campbell N P S	Cardiology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2002
Campbell W I	Anaesthetics	Ulster Community and Hospitals HSS Trust	01/08/2001
Carson D J	Paediatrics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	27/04/2002
Connolly J D R	Anaesthetics	Green Park HSS Trust	01/11/2000
Cooper S J	Psychiatry-Adult	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/07/2002
Crean PM	Anaesthetics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2004
Elborn J S	Medicine-Respiratory	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2004
Evans A E	Public Health Medicine	Eastern Health and Social Services Board	13/08/1999
Fee J P H	Anaesthetics	Green Park Hospital HSS Trust	02/01/2000
Gillespie C A	Psychiatry-Adult	Sperrin Lakeland HSS Trust	01/10/2003
Hawkins S A	Neurology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2001
Jenkins J G	Paediatrics	United Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2001
Johnston G D	Clinical Pharmacology & Therapeutics	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/1999
Kaluskar S K	ENT	Sperrin Lakeland HSS Trust	03/08/2004
Lamey P-J	Oral Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2001
MacMahon J	General Medicine	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2003
Maw R D	Genito-Urinary Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2004
Mc Clelland W M	Pathology/Haematology	N.I. Blood Transfusion Service Agency	01/10/2004
McMurray T J	Anaesthetics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	10/09/2003
Spence R A J	General Surgery	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2004

## **B AWARD HOLDERS**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HPSS EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Abram W P	Clinical Oncology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/08/2001
Adams D A	ENT	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	12/09/2000
Andrews W J	General Medicine	United Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2001
Bell A H	Paediatrics	NI Health Promotion Agency	01/10/2002
Beverland D E	Orthopaedic & Traumatic Surgery	Green Park HSS Trust	01/04/2003
Bingham E A	Dermatology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/08/1998
Campbell F C	Gaestroentrollogical Surgery	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2001
Cinnamond M J	ENT (Otolaryngology)	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/05/1996
Collins J S A	General Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2003
Craig B G	Paediatric Cardiology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2004
Cranley B	General Surgery	Newry & Mourne HSS Trust	09/06/2000
Diamond T	General Surgery	Mater Infirmorum HSS Trust	01/10/2001
Dinsmore W W	Genito-Urinary Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2004
Dowey K E	Accident & Emergency Medicine	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2003
Eedy D J	Dermatology	Craigavon Area Hospital Group HSS Trust	03/08/2004
Elliott P M	Anaesthetics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2000
Fulton R A	Dermatology	Altnagelvin Hospitals HSS Trust	28/01/2001
Gardiner K R	General Surgery	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	13/09/2002
Gilmore D H	Geriatric Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2004
Gregg T A	Paediatric Dentistry	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2001

**B AWARD HOLDERS** (cont'd)

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HPSS EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Hannon R J	General Surgery	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2003
Hood J M	General Surgery	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/1997
Jackson P T	Paediatrics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2004
Johnston P B	Ophthalmology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/1995
Kelly J F	Geriatric Medicine	Sperrin Lakeland HSS Trust	01/02/2003
Kirk S J	General Surgery	Ulster Community and Hospitals Trust	01/06/2003
Linden G J	Dental Medicine Specialties	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/08/2002
Loughran P G	Anaesthetics	Newry and Mourne HSS Trust	01/10/1998
Maxwell R J	General Surgery	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/09/2000
McClure N	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/06/2003
McCluskey D R	General Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2002
McConnell W W M	Public Health Medicine	Western Health and Social Services Board	02/04/1997
McGinnity M G A	Psychiatry-Learning Disability	North & West Belfast HSS Trust	01/08/2001
McGuigan J A	Thoracic Surgery	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2000
McLoughlin J C	General Medicine	Mater Infirmorum Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2000
Montgomery E A	Psychiatry-Adult	Mater Infirmorum Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/1999
Murray J M	Anaesthetics	Green Park HSS Trust	01/04/2004
Nicholls D P	General Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	31/05/1999
Orr I A	Anaesthetics	Craigavon Area Hospital Group HSS Trust	01/08/2001
Passmore A P	Geriatric Medicine	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/06/2003
Quinn R J M	Paediatrics	Altnagelvin Hospitals HSS Trust	01/10/1997

**B AWARD HOLDERS** (cont'd)

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HPSS EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Russell C J	General Medicine	Sperrin Lakeland HSS Trust	01/10/1997
Saunders I D F	Paediatric Dentistry	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/1996
Sharma N K	Ophthalmology	Altnagelvin Hospitals HSS Trust	01/09/2002
Stewart D G T	Public Health Medicine	Eastern Health and Social Services Board	31/12/2002
Stewart M C	Paediatrics	North & West Belfast HSS Trust	01/08/2001
Taggart H M	Geriatric Medicine	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2000
Taylor I C	Geriatric Medicine	Ulster Community and Hospitals HSS Trust	01/10/2003
Taylor R H	Anaesthetics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/10/2001
Telford A M	Public Health Medicine	Southern Health and Social Services Board	01/10/1999
Toner J G	ENT	Ulster Community and Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2004
Traub A I	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2000
Varma M P S	General Medicine	Sperrin Lakeland HSS Trust	01/10/200
Watson J D	Public Health Medicine	Northern Health and Social Services Board	02/05/1999
Wray A R	Orthopaedic & Traumatic Surgery	Altnagelvin Hospitals HSS Trust	01/06/2003

**APPENDIX C****HIGHER CLINICAL EXCELLENCE AWARD HOLDERS  
IN NORTHERN IRELAND****STEP 12**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HPSS EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Doherty CC	Renal Medicine	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Hay RJ	Dermatology	The Queen's University	01/04/2006
Johnston PG	Medical Oncology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Savage J M	Paediatrics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2005

**STEP 10**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HPSS EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Bell PM	General Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Beringer TRO	Geriatric Medicine	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Coyle PV	Pathology-Medical Microbiology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2005
Daly JG	Respiratory Medicine	Altnagelvin Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Dornan JC	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Farling PA	Anaesthetics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Fullerton KJ	Geriatric Medicine	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Harper M A	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2005
Hicks EM	Paediatrics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Houston RF	Clinical Oncology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Irwin ST	General Surgery	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospitals HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Johnston JR	Anaesthetics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Johnston LC	Radiology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006

**STEP 10** (cont'd)

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HPSS EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Jones F G C	Pathology-Haematology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2005
Kee F	Public Health Medicine	Northern Health and Social Services Board	01/04/2005
Lavery GG	Anaesthetics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Maxwell AP	Nephrology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2006
McMullin M F	Pathology-Haematology	Belfast City Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2005
Patterson DG	Psychiatry-Adult	North & West Belfast HSS Trust	01/04/2006
Shields M D	Paediatrics	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2005
Smyth E T M	Pathology-Medical-Microbiology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2005
Young I S	Chemical Pathology	Royal Group of Hospitals and Dental Hospital HSS Trust	01/04/2005

**Produced by: Department of Health, Social Services & Public Safety,  
Castle Buildings, Belfast BT4 3SL**

**Telephone: (028) 9052 2817    Textphone: (028) 9052 7668**

**[www.dhsspsni.gov.uk](http://www.dhsspsni.gov.uk)**

**2007**

**Ref:**