

HPSS MANAGEMENT GROUP

Distinction and Meritorious Service Awards Committee

Annual Report 1999/2000

**Department of Health, Social Services and Public Safety
An Roinn Sláinte, Seirbhísí Sóisialta agus Sábháilteachta Poiblí
October 2001**

FOREWORD

This is the sixth Annual Report of the Distinction and Meritorious Service Awards Committee (DMSAC) for Northern Ireland; it covers the period from 1 April 1999 to 31 March 2000.

The Annual Report is in two parts. Part One contains our Report on the 1999/2000 Awards Round. This Report is supplemented by a table at Appendix A which contains various statistical analyses of the distribution of Awards amongst the HPSS consultant population, taking account of the 1999 Awards Round. Part Two is a list of all consultants who are currently in receipt of Distinction Awards.

The text of the Annual Report will, as last year, be distributed to all consultants, Health Boards and HSS Trusts in Northern Ireland to be made freely available locally to others with an interest in the scheme. The Report will also now be available on the Internet.

The Hon Sir Brian Kerr
Chairman
Distinction and Meritorious Service Awards Committee

PART ONE

REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE

As it is widely known, the HPSS Distinction and Meritorious Service Awards Scheme is designed to reward medical and dental consultants at both local and international level for their professional distinction. This, the sixth Annual Report of the DMSAC, covers the 1999-2000 Awards Round.

Membership of DMSAC

The membership of the Committee as at November 1999 was as follows:

Chairman

The Hon Sir Brian Kerr

Medical Director

Professor John M Bridges CBE MD FRCP FRCPATH

Members

Dame Fiona Caldicott DBE MA BM BCh FRCPsych FRCP FRCGP

Dame Deirdre Hine DBE MB BCh FFPHM FRCP

Professor Robin G Shanks CBE MD DSc FRCP MRIA

Professor George W Johnston OBE MCh FRCS

Dr Maldwyn Morgan MB BS DA FRCA

Mr Thomas Frawley BA LHSM

Dr Harry McGuigan CBE BSc PhD CEng FI Mech E

The three members from Great Britain, Dame Fiona Caldicott, Dame Deirdre Hine and Dr Maldwyn Morgan, are experienced NHS consultants appointed in order to ensure parity of standards. Dame Fiona Caldicott is Principal of Somerville College, Oxford and a Past President of the Royal College of Psychiatrists. She has been a member of the Advisory Committee on Distinction Awards in the UK. Dr Maldwyn Morgan is a Reader in Anaesthetic Practice at the Imperial College School of Medicine, an Honorary Consultant at Hammersmith Hospital and President of the Association of Anaesthetists. Dame Deirdre Hine is a former Chief Medical Officer for Wales and Senior lecturer in the University of Wales College of Medicine. Professor Bridges is a retired haematologist and Professor Johnston a retired surgeon. Professor Shanks is a retired clinical pharmacologist, and Whitla Professor of Therapeutics and Pharmacology and a former Pro-Vice-Chancellor in The Queen's University of Belfast. Mr Frawley the General Manager of the Western Health and Social Services Board resigned July 2000. Dr McGuigan is the Chairman of the United Hospitals Trust.

The Committee wishes to express its gratitude to the outgoing members Dame Fiona Caldicott DBE, and Professor Robin G Shanks CBE for their very valuable contribution to its work.

1999/2000 Awards Round

The 1999 Awards Round was operated in accordance with the detailed arrangements set out in the Guide to the HSS Consultants' Distinction Awards Scheme which was published on 16 April 1999.

The Committee invited nominations for the three grades of Awards from a variety of sources and received a total of 123 recommendations. All the citations received were examined in detail, together with the 1999 CV Questionnaire Form of those recommended. The Committee also carried out a review of the names of all those consultants who had not been recommended.

The DMSAC meeting for the 1999-2000 Awards Round was held on 9 November 1999. Following its customary practice, the Committee paid a visit to Holywell Hospital and Antrim Area Hospital to view the facilities and meet with consultants.

At its later meeting, the full Committee went through all the recommendations and considered them at length. It finally made recommendations for the twenty nine available Awards, comprising of four A+, ten A and fifteen B Awards.

Five Year Reviews

The Committee considered the reviews of one A+, five A and eight B, Award Holders, and recommended renewal of all the Awards for a further five years.

Distribution of Awards

(a) Age Profile

The average age of consultants on appointment in Northern Ireland is approximately 36, although this average varies somewhat in the different specialties. The average age of those consultants who were allocated an Award in 1999-2000 was:

B	53
A	57
A+	58

The average age of those consultants recommended for an Award in 1999-2000 was:

B	53
A	56
A+	59

Some specialties, notably Radiology, Pathology and Mental Illness have a high proportion of younger consultants, who have not yet progressed to the receipt of Awards. In consequence those specialties have a lower proportion of Awards in relation to the number of consultants, but this disparity may be expected to reduce with the passage of time. Some other specialties show divergences from the average, either above or below, but these are generally small specialties and the variations are not significant.

(b) Areas

The total number of eligible consultants in April 1999 was 852 divided between the geographical areas of the four Health and Social Services Boards as follows (consultants in Trusts are for this purpose included in the area in which their Trusts are situated):

Northern	119
Southern	104
Western	119
Eastern	510

The pattern of distribution (Appendix A) shows that 7 of the 9 A+ Awards were held by consultants in the Eastern Health and Social Services Board's area or holding joint appointments, as were 28 out of the 32 A Awards. This reflects the location of the larger hospitals and Queen's University. The distribution of B Awards approaches more closely to the numbers of consultants across the four area Boards.

(c) Gender

In the 1999/2000 Awards Round female consultants received 10.3% of the Awards available for allocation whilst they formed 21% of the total

consultant body. This means that currently female consultants hold 7.1% of the total number of Awards in Northern Ireland (112).

It should be borne in mind that approximately 58% of female consultants (44% of male consultants) have served less than ten years in the grade and so would not ordinarily be considered for an Award, unless the case for recognition was exceptional and supported by written evidence.

The Committee wish to emphasise that Awards are granted to individuals solely on the grounds of merit. It considers that it would be wrong to resort to positive discrimination in favour of any area, age group or gender if it found an imbalance. All consultants are judged equally against the criteria for Awards as set out in Part Two. The Committee is vigilant, however, for any conspicuous disparity, in case that might show that there are groups whose claims have been overlooked or given less than sufficient consideration.

Guide to the HSS Consultants' Distinction Awards Scheme

In April 1999 the Department issued a Guide to HSS consultants and employers which explains the operation of the current scheme, the framework for which was set out in Circular HSS (TC8) 10/95. The Guide includes information on the purpose of the Awards Scheme, numbers and values of Awards, eligibility and review of Awards. The Department will shortly be issuing a similar Guide for the 2000/2001 Awards Round which will explain the nomination arrangements and include a timetable for the forthcoming Awards Round. The Guide will, as last year, be distributed to all consultants, Health Boards and HSS Trusts in Northern Ireland.

Additional copies of the Guide or Annual Report can be obtained from Mrs Dympna Sisk, DMSAC Secretariat, 028-90524243 or via the internet on the Department of Health, Social Services and Public Safety Web Site at <http://www.dhsspsni.gov.uk>.

DISTINCTION AWARDS
ANALYSIS BY TYPE OF AWARD, SPECIALTY AND PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION
NORTHERN IRELAND AT 1 APRIL 1999 (1999/2000 AWARDS ROUND)

SPECIALTY	TOTAL ELIGIBLE IN SPECIALTY	CONSULTANTS HOLDING AWARDS		NORTHERN			SOUTHERN			EASTERN			WESTERN		
		NUMBER	PERCENTAGE	A+	A	B	A+	A	B	A+	A	B	A+	A	B
Anaesthetics	137	14	10.2	-	-	1	-	1	2	-	5	5	-	-	-
ENT	18	5	27.8	-	-	1	-	-	1	1	-	1	-	-	1
General Medicine & Allied Specialties (1)	222	39	17.6	-	1	2	-	1	1	4	10	16	1	-	3
Mental Illness (2)	94	9	9.6	1	-	-	-	-	-	-	2	5	-	-	1
Obs & Gynae (3)	49	6	12.2	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	2	3	-	1	-
Ophthalmology	18	2	11.1	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	-	1	-	-	-
Orthopaedics	31	4	12.9	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	4	-	-	-
Pathology (4)	66	5	7.6	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	3	2	-	-	-
Public Health Med (5)	30	4	13.3	-	-	1	-	-	1	-	1	-	-	-	1
Radiology (6)	73	4	5.5	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	3	-	-	1
Surgery (7)	91	16	17.6	-	-	1	-	-	-	1	5	7	-	-	2
Dental Specialties (8)	23	4	17.4	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	4	-	-	-
TOTALS	852	112	13.2	1	1	6	-	2	5	7	28	51	1	1	9
% ALLOCATION OF AWARDS				11.1	3.1	8.5	0	6.5	7.0	77.8	87.5	71.8	11.1	3.1	12.7

NOTES

(1) GENERAL MEDICINE & ALLIED SPECIALTIES-

Anatomy, Accident & Emergency, Cardiology, Clinical Neuro-Physiology, Clinical Genetics, Clinical Pharmacology, Dermatology, Endocrinology and Diabetes, General Medicine, General Medicine-Special Interest Geriatrics, Genito-Urinary Medicine, Geriatric Medicine, Infectious Diseases, Nephrology, Neurology, Paediatrics, Physiology, Rheumatology & Rehabilitation, Sports Medicine.

(2) MENTAL ILLNESS

- Child & Adolescent Psychiatry, Forensic Psychiatry, Mental Handicap, Mental Illness, Psychiatry of Old Age, Psychotherapy.

(3) OBSTETRICS & GYNAECOLOGY

- Obstetrics & Gynaecology.

(4) PATHOLOGY

- Chemical Pathology, General Pathology, Haematology & Blood Transfusion, Histology, Histopathology, Immuno-Pathology, Medical Microbiology, Neuropathology.

(5) PUBLIC HEALTH MEDICINE

- Occupational Medicine, Public Health Medicine.

(6) RADIOLOGY

- Radiology, Radiotherapy, Medical Oncology.

(7) SURGERY

- Cardiothoracic Surgery, General Surgery, Neurosurgery, Paediatric Surgery, Plastic Surgery, Urology.

(8) DENTAL SPECIALTIES

- Dental Anatomy, Dental Prosthetics, Oral Surgery, Paediatric & Preventative Dentistry, Periodontics, Restorative Dentistry, Orthodontics.

	NORTHERN	SOUTHERN	EASTERN	WESTERN
NUMBER OF AWARDS PER AREA	8	7	86	11
% NUMBER OF TOTAL AWARDS	7.1%	6.3%	76.8%	9.8%

NUMBER OF ELIGIBLE CONSULTANTS	119	104	510	119
% NUMBER OF TOTAL ELIGIBLE CONSULTANTS	14.0%	12.2%	59.9%	14.0%

PART TWO

CONSULTANT DISTINCTION AWARD HOLDERS

Part Two of this Annual Report lists all consultants employed by the HPSS in Northern Ireland who held an Award immediately following the 1999/2000 Distinction Awards Round.

CRITERIA FOR DISTINCTION AWARDS

Distinction Awards are granted in recognition of outstanding professional work of national and international significance which involves consultants devoting a substantial part of their time to activities of wider benefit to patient care in the HPSS/NHS as a whole, including work carried out in the local setting which has application nationally.

Awards are not seniority payments, nor are they given to holders of particular types of post as of right. To warrant consideration for an Award, the DMSAC will look for performance over and above what is normally expected in respect of service to patients, teaching and the management and development of the service. In general the DMSAC will expect a record of achievement across a range of the criteria listed below from consultants nominated for an Award: **success in only one of these areas will not normally be sufficient:**

- (1) Professional excellence, which for most consultants will be founded on the sustained quality of the service they provide to patient care and recognition of leadership.
- (2) Research, innovation and improvement in the service. The expectations may vary for different groups - e.g. HSS Board or Trust, teaching and honorary appointments - and will relate to their differing opportunities.
- (3) Outstanding administrative or management effort, including those who effectively implement innovations, involving activities of national significance, which will again be related to opportunity and normal expectations. For example, there will be exceptions for Joint Appointments (eg clinical academic staff and research workers) whose duties include a smaller HPSS management content. Consultants working in the community and management-based specialties such as public health medicine and dental public health are expected, for example, to secure measurable achievement in service development as part of their normal work, so that they have to be assessed on the basis of above- average effort or contribution.
- (4) An outstanding contribution to other forms of service development such as clinical audit.
- (5) Teaching and training: for example, special effort to train junior staff, or taking a leading role in undergraduate or postgraduate teaching, (including the establishment of short-term national or overseas training links), especially if undertaken in addition to ordinary duties. Contribution by consultants to training of other HPSS staff, and also to public education and health promotion will also be relevant.
- (6) Outstanding and sustained service to the HPSS in an exceptionally hard-pressed post. This criterion would not normally be the sole grounds for an Award, and would not apply above B Award level.
- (7) For the smaller number of Awards available at A and A+ level, a very high standard is inevitably required. Awards might be recommended for those who are evident leaders in a clinical or scientific field, those with special clinical and managerial skills, those who contribute new ideas of proven worth, those who effectively implement innovations, those who are generally accepted as leaders of their profession in Northern Ireland and those with a national or international reputation.

A+ AWARD HOLDERS

NAME	SPECIALTY	LOCATION	DATE OF AWARD
Adgey A A J	Cardiology	Royal Victoria Hospital	02/01/2000
Archer D B	Ophthalmology	Royal Victoria Hospital	30/09/1989
Barros D'Sa A A B	General Surgery	Royal Victoria Hospital	01/10/1999
Hadden D R	Endocrinology/Diabetes	Royal Victoria Hospital	01/06/1995
Keegan D A J	General Medicine	Altnagelvin Area Hospital	01/04/1999
Kerr A G	ENT (Otolaryngology)	Royal Victoria Hospital	01/10/1991
King D J	Mental Illness	Holywell Hospital	01/10/1998
Nevin N C	Clinical Genetics	Belfast City Hospital	01/04/1997
Stout R W	Geriatric Medicine	Belfast City Hospital	01/02/2000

A AWARD HOLDERS

NAME	SPECIALTY	LOCATION	DATE OF AWARD
Atkinson A B	Endocrinology/Diabetes	Royal Victoria Hospital	01/02/2000
Boston V E	Paediatric Surgery	Royal Belfast Hospital for Sick Children	01/10/1999
Byrnes D P	Neurosurgery	Royal Victoria Hospital	01/04/1997
Carson I W	Anaesthetics	Royal Victoria Hospital	14/10/1995
Coppel D L	Anaesthetics	Royal Victoria Hospital	30/04/1990
Douglas J F	Nephrology	Belfast City Hospital	01/04/1999
Evans A E	Public Health Medicine	Eastern H& SS Board	13/08/1999
Fee J P H	Anaesthetics	Musgrave Park Hospital	02/01/2000
Halliday H L	Paediatrics	Royal Maternity Hospital	02/10/1997
Hayes J R	General Medicine	Belfast City Hospital	01/10/1995
Johnston G D	Clinical Pharmacology & Therapeutics	Belfast City Hospital	01/10/1999
Keilty S R	Anaesthetics	Royal Belfast Hospital for Sick Children	01/04/1991
Lamki H	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Royal Maternity Hospital	01/04/1991
Martin D H	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Altnagelvin Area Hospital	02/08/1999
McCaughey W	Anaesthetics	Craigavon Area Hospital	31/05/1999
McClelland R J	Psychiatry	Belfast City Hospital	01/09/1996
McClure B G	Paediatrics	Royal Maternity Hospital	01/04/1997
McKelvey S T D	General Surgery	Ulster Hospital	31/03/1990
Mirakhur R K	Anaesthetics	Royal Victoria Hospital	01/10/1997
Mulholland H C	Cardiology	Royal Victoria Hospital	01/04/1999
Nelson J K	General Medicine	Ulster Hospital	01/08/1995
O’Gorman E C	Psychiatry	Belfast City Hospital	31/03/1999
O’Kane H O J	Cardiothoracic Surgery	Royal Victoria Hospital	01/04/1989
Odling-Smee G W	General Surgery	Belfast City Hospital	29/05/1995
Redmond A O B	Paediatrics	Royal Belfast Hospital for Sick Children	01/04/1998
Reid M M	Paediatrics	Royal Maternity Hospital	01/04/1999
Robinson T J	General Medicine	Craigavon Area Hospital	01/10/1998

A AWARD HOLDERS

NAME	SPECIALTY	LOCATION	DATE OF AWARD
Sloan J M	Histopathology	Royal Victoria Hospital	01/01/1999
Thompson W	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Royal Maternity Hospital	01/04/1988
Toner P G	Histopathology	Royal Victoria Hospital	30/09/1993
Trimble E R	Chemical Pathology	Royal Victoria Hospital	01/10/1997
Wilson C	Cardiology	Antrim Area Hospital	01/10/1997

B AWARD HOLDERS

NAME	SPECIALTY	LOCATION	DATE OF AWARD
Bali I M	Anaesthetics	Antrim Area Hospital	01/06/1995
Benington I C	Dental Prosthetics	Royal Victoria Hospital	30/06/1989
Bingham E A	Dermatology	Royal Victoria Hospital	01/08/1998
Black J H A	ENT (Otolaryngology)	Antrim Area Hospital	22/05/1988
Boyle D D	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Royal Maternity Hospital	07/05/1998
Brennen M D	Plastic Surgery	Ulster Hospital	01/04/1999
Calderwood J W	Orthopaedics	Musgrave Park Hospital	01/04/1995
Callender M E	General Medicine	Royal Victoria Hospital	13/08/1999
Campbell N P S	Cardiology	Royal Victoria Hospital	30/05/1998
Campbell W I	Anaesthetics	Ulster Hospital	31/03/1999
Canavan D A	Infectious Diseases	Royal Victoria Hospital	01/04/1994
Carson D J	Paediatrics	Royal Belfast Hospital for Sick Children	01/08/1998
Cinnamond M J	ENT (Otolaryngology)	Belfast City Hospital	01/05/1996
Connolly J D R	Anaesthetics	Musgrave Park Hospital	01/04/1997
Cooper S J	Psychiatry	Belfast City Hospital	02/10/1997
Curran P S	Psychiatry	Mater Infirmorum Hospital	01/04/1997
Doherty C C	Nephrology	Belfast City Hospital	01/10/1997
Dornan J C	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Royal Maternity Hospital	02/08/1999
Fannin T F	Neurosurgery	Royal Victoria Hospital	28/04/1995
Gamble J A S	Anaesthetics	Belfast City Hospital	01/04/1999
Gillespie C A	Psychiatry	Sperrin Lakeland HQ	01/04/1998
Glasgow J F T	Paediatrics	Royal Belfast Hospital for Sick Children	31/05/1993
Hawkins S A	Neurology	Royal Victoria Hospital	23/06/1998
Hood J M	General Surgery	Royal Victoria Hospital	01/04/1997
Humphreys W G	General Surgery	Antrim Area Hospital	01/09/1995
Jenkins J G	Paediatrics	Antrim Area Hospital	01/10/1999
Johnston J R	Anaesthetics	Royal Victoria Hospital	01/10/1998
Johnston P B	Ophthalmology	Royal Victoria Hospital	01/10/1995

B AWARD HOLDERS

NAME	SPECIALTY	LOCATION	DATE OF AWARD
Johnston P G	Medical Oncology	Belfast City Hospital	01/01/1999
Johnston S R	Urology	Belfast City Hospital	01/06/1998
Kaluskar S K	ENT	Tyrone County Hospital	01/04/1999
Khan M M	Cardiology	Royal Victoria Hospital	01/04/1997
Laird J D	Radiology	Royal Victoria Hospital	30/09/1990
Lamey P-J	Oral Surgery	Royal Victoria Hospital	01/01/1998
Leonard A G	Plastic Surgery	Ulster Hospital	01/05/1996
Loughran P G	Anaesthetics	Daisy Hill Hospital	01/10/1998
MacMahon J	General Medicine	Belfast City Hospital	01/08/1999
Marsh D R	Orthopaedic & Traumatic Surgery	Royal Victoria Hospital	01/04/1997
McAuley R R	Child & Adolescent Psychiatry	Forster Green Hospital	01/10/1995
McClelland W M	Pathology	Blood Transfusion Service	01/06/1998
McConnell J B	General Medicine	Antrim Area Hospital	01/05/1999
McConnell W W M	Public Health Medicine	Western H & SS Board	02/04/1997
McFarland R J	General Medicine	Ulster Hospital	01/04/1998
McGimpsey J G	Oral Surgery	Royal Victoria Hospital	01/08/1995
McMurray T J	Anaesthetics	Royal Victoria Hospital	01/02/2000
McNamee B T	General Medicine	South Tyrone Hospital	01/04/1992
McNeill H G	Anaesthetics	South Tyrone Hospital	01/04/1999
Mollan R A B	Orthopaedics	Musgrave Park Hospital	01/04/1989
Montgomery E A	Psychiatry	Mater Infirmorum Hospital	01/10/1999
Morris T C M	Haematology/Blood Transfusion	Belfast City Hospital	01/08/1996
Morrison C C	Radiology	Altnagelvin Area Hospital	01/05/1994
Murtagh J G	Cardiology	Belfast City Hospital	01/04/1996
Nicholls D P	General Medicine	Royal Victoria Hospital	31/05/1999
Nixon J R	Orthopaedic & Traumatic Surgery	Musgrave Park Hospital	01/04/1998
O'Connor F A	General Medicine	Altnagelvin Area Hospital	01/09/1996

B AWARD HOLDERS

NAME	SPECIALTY	LOCATION	DATE OF AWARD
Panesar K J S	General Surgery	Altnagelvin Area Hospital	01/04/1998
Pinto D J	General Surgery	Tyrone County Hospital	01/04/1992
Quinn R J M	Paediatrics	Altnagelvin Area Hospital	01/10/1997
Riddell J G	Clinical Pharmacology	Belfast City Hospital	01/06/1995
Russell C F J	General Surgery	Royal Victoria Hospital	27/05/1996
Russell C J	General Medicine	Tyrone County Hospital	01/10/1997
Saunders I D F	Paediatric & Preventive Dentistry	Royal Victoria Hospital	01/04/1996
Savage J M	Paediatrics	Royal Belfast Hospital for Sick Children	01/10/1997
Scott M E	Cardiology	Belfast City Hospital	01/04/1990
Shanks O E P	Psychiatry	Muckamore Abbey Hospital	01/04/1998
Singh K P	ENT (Otolaryngology)	Craigavon Area Hospital	30/09/1993
Spence R A J	General Surgery	Belfast City Hospital	02/01/2000
Sproule W B	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Lagan Valley Hospital	01/04/1998
Telford A M	Public Health Medicine	Southern H &SS Board	01/10/1999
Watson J D	Public Health Medicine	Northern H & SS Board	02/05/1999
Wilson H K	Radiology	Ulster Hospital	01/04/1997