



Department of  
**Health, Social Services  
and Public Safety**

[www.dhsspsni.gov.uk](http://www.dhsspsni.gov.uk)

AN ROINN

**Sláinte, Seirbhísí Sóisialta  
agus Sábháilteachta Poiblí**

MÄNNYSTRIE O

**Poustie, Resydënter Heisin  
an Fowk Siccar**

# **Northern Ireland Clinical Excellence Awards Committee**

***Annual Report  
2008-2009***

## CONTENTS

	<b>Page</b>
Foreword	1
<u>PART ONE</u>	
Report on the outcome of higher awards	2
List of higher awards granted in 2008–2009	8
Table 1(1): Analysis of Higher Awards by Specialty	9
Table 2(1): Analysis of Higher Awards by Gender	10
Table 3(1): Analysis of Higher Awards by Trust	10
Table 4(1): Analysis of Higher Awards by Age	11
Table 5(1): Analysis of Higher Awards by Ethnic Origin	11
Table 6(1): Analysis of Higher Awards by Community Background	11
Table 7: Citations supported	12
<u>PART TWO</u>	
Report on the outcome of lower awards	13
List of lower awards granted in 2008–2009	16
Table 1(2): Outcome of lower awards	23
Table 2(2): Consultants in receipt of Lower Clinical Excellence Awards/Discretionary Points	23
Table 3(2): Analysis by Gender	24
Table 4(2): Analysis of Lower Awards by Community Background	24
Table 5(2): Analysis of Lower Awards by Ethnic Origin	24
<u>Appendices</u>	
Appendix A – Membership of NICEAC	25
Appendix B - List of distinction award holders in Northern Ireland	26
Appendix C – List of higher clinical excellence award holders in Northern Ireland	29

## FOREWORD

This is the fourth annual report of the Northern Ireland Clinical Excellence Awards Committee (NICEAC). The report covers the period 1 April 2008 to 31 March 2009.

This year the process was once again a highly competitive one, with a total of 89 applications for higher awards and only 17 awards available for allocation. The committee found its task of deciding which consultants should be recommended for awards an extremely difficult one, particularly given the large number of excellent consultants who had applied. However, the committee was unanimous in its final recommendations for awards.

In our last report, the committee commented on its concerns about the lower awards process, and the difficulty the lack of lower awards created for the scheme to operate consistently and continuously from local to regional level as was originally intended. Since then the Department has carried out a review of the scheme. The review covered a number of areas including the mechanism for funding lower awards. The committee contributed to the review as part of the consultation process. Following the review the Department introduced a number of changes including: a formula based system for allocating lower awards (a minimum of 0.25 awards per eligible consultant); step 9 awards to be taken over by the regional committee; and consultants no longer allowed to apply for both a lower and a higher award in the same year. The Department allocated an additional £200k in 2008-2009 on a recurrent basis to help Trusts to meet the cost of lower awards, in addition to an extra £100k allocated recurrently in 2007-2008. The committee welcomed the review outcome and the additional funding provided by the Department. The committee will continue to monitor the lower awards process to see how the changes work in practice. It is pleasing to note that in the first year of the formula based approach, there has been an improvement in the overall number of lower awards (169, compared to 125 in 2007-2008).

Part One of this document reports on the outcome of the higher awards process in 2008-2009 and analyses the distribution of higher awards across the consultant population. It includes a list of the names of the consultants recommended by the committee for higher awards in 2008-2009.

Part Two reports on the outcome of the lower awards process in 2008-2009 and analyses the distribution of lower awards. It also includes a list of the names of the consultants who received lower awards in 2008-2009.

Once again we wish to thank the consultants, committee members and the secretariat for all their support during the fourth year of the new scheme.

**Pat Carvill**  
**Chairman**  
**Northern Ireland Clinical Excellence Awards Committee**

## **PART ONE**

### **REPORT ON THE OUTCOME OF HIGHER AWARDS**

#### **Introduction**

1. This is the fourth annual report of the Northern Ireland Clinical Excellence Awards Committee (NICEAC) and covers the 2008-2009 awards round. The clinical excellence awards scheme, which was introduced in 2005, combines the discretionary points and distinction awards into a single graduated scheme. The scheme is governed by common assessment criteria with standard forms for all levels of awards. Lower awards (steps 1-8) are decided by local Trust committees. Higher awards (steps 9-12) are recommended by the regional committee (NICEAC).
2. The committee's remit is to recommend to the Department which medical and dental consultants should receive higher clinical excellence awards, and also to monitor and quality assure the outworkings of the local awards process. The committee, in making its recommendations, must have regard to the number of awards available for allocation. The Department is responsible for determining the number of higher awards that should be made available.
3. The rationale of the Northern Ireland clinical excellence awards scheme, as set out in the Guide to the scheme, is to "reward exceptional personal contributions made by individual consultants (above the normal expectations of a postholder) to the delivery of high quality care to patients and to the continuous improvement of Health and Social Care (HSC)."

#### **Membership of NICEAC**

4. The committee is constituted as follows: a lay chair, a vice chair (medical director), two HSC medical/dental members; two HSC employer members, one lay member, and two GB medical/dental members. An independent external observer with a background in HR is present at committee meetings as an advisor on procedural aspects.
5. The membership of the committee for the 2008-2009 awards round is set out at Appendix A.

## 2008-2009 Awards Round

6. The awards round commenced in April 2008 and was completed in February 2009. The committee invited self nominations from all HSC consultants in August and a total of 89 applications were received. There were 45 applications for step 9 awards, 23 for step 10 awards, 13 for step 11 awards and 8 for step 12 awards. There was a maximum of 17 awards available for allocation.
7. Because the awards process was extremely competitive, it was inevitable that a considerable number of excellent consultants failed to be recommended for an award, and the committee wishes to place on record its appreciation of the very high standard of performance that was apparent in many of the applications which on this occasion were unsuccessful.
8. The committee awarded a score for each of the four criteria: delivering a high quality service; developing a high quality service; managing a high quality service; and research, teaching and training, taking into account the information contained in the CV forms and the citation forms. For step 9, to ensure consistency of approach with other local level awards, the first criterion was double weighted and the remaining three criteria were equally weighted. For steps 10–12 all four criteria were equally weighted. The committee in deciding what score to award, looked for specific evidence of performance or achievements which could be regarded as over and above what would normally be expected of a consultant in a particular post. In order to achieve a high score in a particular criterion a consultant needed to demonstrate clear evidence of particularly outstanding performance in relation to the attributes covered by that criterion (details of the attributes required for each criterion are contained in Section 5 of the Guide to the Scheme).
9. The Chair and each of the 8 panel members independently scored each of the four criteria, for step 9 and step 10 applications, awarding marks in the range 0-12, with 12 being the best. These scores were aggregated, and the resulting scores and consequent rank ordering were then considered and discussed by the committee as a whole at a meeting in January 2009. Scores were agreed for the 45 step 9 and 23 step 10 applications and a shortlisting cut off score was agreed. A total of 22 step 9 and 14 step 10 applications were shortlisted. Following the meeting in January members were allowed time to reflect on their initial scores for the shortlisted applications in the light of discussion at the meeting, and where they considered it appropriate members were free to amend their scoring. The revised scores were again aggregated, and were the subject of discussion by the full committee on a second occasion, in February 2009. Following review, the final scores were agreed for each of the shortlisted candidates and there was unanimous agreement on the 10 highest scores for step 9 and the 6 highest scores for step 10 who were the successful candidates. Similar scoring and consideration was given to the step 11 and step 12 applications. The committee unanimously agreed on the highest step 11 score, who was the successful candidate. The committee agreed that no step 12 candidate should be recommended for an award. The names of the successful step 9, step 10 and step 11 consultants are listed at

page 9 A full list of all consultants in Northern Ireland holding distinction awards and higher clinical excellence awards can be found at Appendices B and C.

10. Some problems were identified by the committee again this year with regard to the completion of citations. Some citation writers were not selective enough about which consultants they supported, and some did not provide sufficient justification for the gradings awarded. Table 7 shows the number of citations for step 9 and step 10 applicants supported by employers and senior award holders. The committee undertook to meet relevant employers and senior award holders in order to provide further advice and guidance on the citation process.
11. In February 2009 the committee visited Holywell Hospital and Antrim Area Hospital. The committee was most impressed by the work in these units and was grateful for the warm welcome it received. Consultants from the Northern area were given the opportunity of questioning committee members about the awards scheme.

### **Five Year Reviews**

12. Higher clinical excellence awards and distinction awards are subject to review every five years. The five year review process is important to ensure that consultants in receipt of awards continue to meet the criteria for awards. The committee can recommend downgrading or withdrawing an award if it believes an individual consultant does not continue to fulfil the criteria.
13. A total of 16 distinction awards were subject to review in this awards round. The committee Chair and Medical Director carefully considered the CV forms and the citation forms received from employers relating to each consultant and reported their findings to the full committee at its meeting in February. The committee recommended that 14 awards should continue for a further five years. In two cases the committee considered there was insufficient information to justify renewal for a further five years. It recommended renewal for one year only with a further review undertaken before the end of the one year period.

### **Feedback**

14. A consultant who has applied for a higher clinical excellence award and is dissatisfied with the committee's decision has the right of appeal to an independent appeals panel. An appeals panel will only consider the process by which the committee arrived at its decision; it will not consider whether an award should or should not have been made. A consultant must, in the first instance, request written feedback from the Chairman of NICEAC. Following the allocation of awards for 2008-2009, 39 consultants (4 step 12s, 5 step 11, 7 step 10s and 23 step 9s) requested feedback and received a written response from the Chairman. Two of those consultants (both step 9) requested further feedback at a meeting with the Chairman and Medical Director. One other consultant lodged a formal appeal. This was considered by an independent appeals panel who did not uphold the consultant's appeal.

## **Distribution of Higher Awards**

15. The committee monitors the distribution of higher awards in six areas: specialty, gender, Trust, age, ethnic origin and community background. The purpose of monitoring the outcome of awards is to identify, and if necessary permit the examination of reasons for any imbalances in the distribution of awards. However, it must be emphasised that awards are granted to individuals solely on the grounds of merit. The committee does not positively discriminate in favour of any particular group. It is highly unlikely in a competitive process such as this (and given the small number of awards available annually) that there will be a balanced proportion of awards between the various groups. Nevertheless, the monitoring process is extremely important; it is essential that any imbalances are identified and that the reasons for those imbalances are fully examined.
16. As mentioned above a total of 17 awards were made (1 step 11, 6 step 10s and 10 step 9s). The step 11 award was allocated to a step 10 award holder. All those with a minimum of step 4/4 discretionary points were eligible to apply for a step 9 award. On this occasion, the six step 10 awards were all allocated to B distinction award holders, although the committee does not take account of the level of any pre-existing award once a consultant is eligible to apply. The ten step 9 awards were allocated to lower award / discretionary points holders.

### ***Specialty***

17. There are variations in the distribution of awards across the range of specialties (see Table 1(1)). For this awards round there was a reasonable spread of awards across specialties with a total of ten specialties receiving at least one award. Most awards went to surgery (4 awards), general medicine (3 awards) and anaesthetics and pathology (2 awards each). An analysis of the overall distribution of awards following the 2008-2009 awards round shows that specialties such as psychiatry, and radiology continue to have a lower proportion of awards. Three higher award holders in psychiatry retired this year thus reducing the overall number of award holders in this specialty.

### ***Gender***

18. This year there was an improvement on the number of female consultants applying for an award and in the number of awards granted. 7.9% of all applicants were female compared to 5.6% last year, and female consultants received 11.8% (2 awards) of all higher awards granted in the 2008-2009 awards round, compared to no awards last year. However, the overall proportion of higher awards held by female consultants has decreased to 7.3%% (from 8.7% last year) (see Table 2(1)), as the two awards granted were allocated to females already holding a higher award. There remains a significant under representation of female consultants at the higher award level given that female consultants represent 28% of the consultant population. The committee would continue to welcome more self nominations from female consultants.

### ***Trust***

19. Table 3(1) gives a breakdown of the number of applications and awards granted by Trusts. The Belfast Trust contains 47.6% of the total consultant population, but holds 73.4% of all awards. The other four Trusts contain between 11.4 – 13.7% of the consultant population and hold between 1.9 – 7.3% of all awards. In this awards round 62.9% of all applicants were from the Belfast Trust and 76.4% of available awards went to consultants in the Belfast Trust. 13.5% of all applicants were from the South Eastern Trust and consultants in that Trust received 11.8% of available awards. The Southern and Western Trusts each received 5.9% of available awards (1 award). No award went to consultants in the Northern Trust. There remains an imbalance in the geographical distribution of awards.

### ***Age***

20. The average age of those consultants who received an award in 2008-2009 was 49 for step 9 awards and 53 for step 10 awards (up slightly on last year when it was 51) (see Table 4(1)). It is to be expected that higher award holders will tend to be older, given the experience and length of time needed to achieve the very high standards required. However, it is noteworthy that a step 11 award and four step 9 awards were granted to consultants in the 45 - 49 age band and that one step 9 award was granted to a consultant in the 40 – 44 age band. This is an indication that the scheme is able to recognise the achievements of outstanding younger consultants.

### ***Ethnic Origin***

21. Out of the 89 applications received, no data was provided on ethnic origin on three of those applications. 3.4% of consultants who applied for an award (applications) declared themselves as coming from the minority ethnic groups (see Table 5(1)). 5.9% (1 award) of higher awards granted in the 2008- 2009 awards round went to consultants from the smaller ethnic groups. This was an improvement on last year when no awards were granted. The evidence suggests an under representation of consultants from the smaller ethnic groups at the higher award level, and the committee would welcome more applications from eligible consultants in these groups. A survey of Trusts in 2007 indicates that 7% of all consultants are from the ethnic minority groupings.

## ***Community Background***

22. Most consultants provided the relevant information on community background on the monitoring form. An analysis of those who applied for an award shows that 55% declared themselves as coming from a Protestant community (PC) background, 27% from a Roman Catholic community (RCC) background, 14.6% from “neither” a PC nor a RCC background and 3.4% were “not knows” (see Table 6(1)). A survey of Trusts in 2007 on the consultant population indicates that 48% of consultants have declared a PC background, 31.5% a RCC background, 9.5% neither a PC nor a RCC background, and 11% were “not knows”. The proportion of applications from consultants declaring a RCC background (27%) was below the proportion of consultants from a RCC background in the consultant population as a whole (31.5%).
23. An analysis of the awards made in this round shows that 8 awards went to consultants who had declared a PC background, 6 awards went to consultants who had declared a RCC background, 2 awards went to consultants who had declared themselves as coming from neither a PC nor a RCC background and 1 award to “not knows”. (see Table 6(1)). The proportion of awards going to consultants who had declared a RCC background (35.3%) exceeds the proportion of applications made, and is an increase on last year (23.1%).
24. The committee remains committed to the principle of awards being made purely on the basis of individual merit. Information on the community background of applicants is not, of course, made available to committee members, and scoring is conducted without regard to this factor. We recognise that with such small numbers of awards, year to year fluctuations in this area may be inevitable: even a single award can make a significant difference to the respective success rates. However, we will continue to closely monitor the outcomes of awards in order to identify general trends, and will continue to seek to identify and to examine the reasons for any imbalances.

## **Further Information**

- 25 Further information about the scheme or additional copies of the guide or the annual report can be obtained by contacting the NICEAC secretariat either by telephone (028 905 22869) or by writing to the NICEAC secretariat at Room D1, Castle Buildings, Upper Newtownards Road, Belfast, BT4 3SJ. The Guide and the annual report are also available on the Department’s website [www.dhsspsni.gov.uk/](http://www.dhsspsni.gov.uk/) (health and social care/clinical excellence awards scheme).

## LIST OF HIGHER AWARDS GRANTED IN 2008-2009

The following consultants employed by the HSC in Northern Ireland were granted clinical excellence awards in 2008-2009

### STEP 11

NAME	SPECIALTY	EMPLOYER	DATE OF AWARD
Young I S	Chemical Pathology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008

### STEP 10

Diamond T	General Surgery	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
Hannon R J	General Surgery Spec. Int. Vascular Surgery	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
Loughran P G	Anaesthetics	Southern Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
McGinnity M G A	Psychiatry-Learning Disability	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
Passmore A P	Geriatric Medicine	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
Stewart M C	Paediatrics	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008

### STEP 9

Brown JH	Nephrology (Renal)	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
Hill D A	Anaesthetics	South Eastern Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
Hussey D L	Restorative Dentistry	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
Kelly B E	Radiology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
McCance D R	General Medicine	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
Moorehead R J	General Surgery	South Eastern Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
Morrison P J	Clinical Genetics	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
O'Kane M J	Clinical Chemistry	Western Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
Soong C V	General Surgery Spec. Int. Vascular Surgery	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
Stevens A B	Occupational Health	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008

TABLE 1 (1)

ANALYSIS OF HIGHER AWARDS BY SPECIALTY AT 1 APRIL 2008 (2008-2009 AWARDS ROUND)

SPECIALTY	CONSULTANTS WHO APPLIED FOR AN AWARD 2008/2009			CONSULTANTS WHO RECEIVED AWARDS 2008/2009		CONSULTANTS HOLDING AWARDS		DISTRIBUTION OF AWARDS BY GRADE								
	No	% of consultant body	Average Age by Specialty	No	% of self nominations	No	% of available awards	No	% of overall awards	A+	A	B	Step 12	Step 11	Step 10	Step 9
Anaesthetics	193	15.6%	47	14	15.7%	2	11.8%	15	13.8%	1	4	3	-	-	6	1
ENT	24	1.9%	51	1	1.1%	-	-	3	2.8%	-	1	1	-	-	1	-
General Medicine & Allied Specialties (1)	247	20.0%	47	24	27.0%	3	17.6%	26	23.9%	1	5	9	2	-	6	3
Geriatric Medicine	37	3.0%	50	6	6.7%	1	5.9%	7	6.4%	-	-	3	-	-	4	-
Mental Illness (2)	128	10.4%	46	4	4.5%	1	5.9%	4	3.7%	-	1	-	-	-	3	-
Obs & Gynae	66	5.3%	50	5	5.6%	-	-	5	4.6%	-	1	2	-	-	2	-
Ophthalmology	30	2.4%	48	-	-	-	-	2	1.8%	-	-	2	-	-	-	-
Orthopaedics	44	3.6%	48	-	-	-	-	2	1.8%	-	-	2	-	-	-	-
Paediatrics	86	7.0%	48	6	6.7%	1	5.9%	8	7.3%	-	1	1	2	-	4	-
Pathology (3)	85	6.9%	48	9	10.1%	2	11.8%	8	7.3%	-	1	-	-	1	5	1
Public Health Medicine (4)	36	2.9%	53	5	5.6%	1	5.9%	7	6.4%	-	1	4	-	-	1	1
Radiology	96	7.8%	46	4	4.5%	1	5.9%	2	1.8%	-	-	-	-	-	1	1
Oncology (5)	25	2.0%	46	1	1.1%	-	-	3	2.8%	-	-	1	1	-	1	-
Surgery (6)	113	9.1%	49	7	7.9%	4	23.5%	12	11.0%	-	1	4	-	-	5	2
Dental Specialties (7)	26	2.1%	50	3	3.4%	1	5.9%	5	4.6%	-	1	1	-	-	2	1
<b>TOTALS</b>	<b>1236</b>			<b>89</b>		<b>17</b>		<b>109</b>		<b>2</b>	<b>17</b>	<b>33</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>41</b>	<b>10</b>

NOTES

- (1) GENERAL MEDICINE & ALLIED SPECIALTIES - Anatomy, Accident & Emergency, Cardiology, Clinical Neuro-Physiology, Clinical Genetics, Clinical Pharmacology, Dermatology, Endocrinology and Diabetes, General Medicine, Genito-Urinary Medicine, Infectious Diseases, Nephrology, Neurology, Physiology, Rheumatology, Rehabilitation Medicine, Sports Medicine.
- (2) MENTAL ILLNESS - Child & Adolescent Psychiatry, Forensic Psychiatry, Mental Handicap, Mental Illness, Psychiatry of Old Age, Psychotherapy.
- (3) PATHOLOGY - Chemical Pathology, General Pathology, Haematology & Blood Transfusion, Histology, Histopathology, Immuno-Pathology, Medical Microbiology, Neuropathology.
- (4) PUBLIC HEALTH MEDICINE - Occupational Medicine, Public Health Medicine.
- (5) ONCOLOGY - Clinical Oncology, Medical Oncology.
- (6) SURGERY - Cardiothoracic Surgery, General Surgery, Neurosurgery, Paediatric Surgery, Plastic Surgery, Urology.
- (7) DENTAL SPECIALTIES - Dental Anatomy, Dental Prosthetics, Oral Surgery, Paediatric & Preventative Dentistry, Periodontics, Restorative Dentistry, Orthodontics

**TABLE 2 (1)****ANALYSIS OF HIGHER AWARDS BY GENDER**

	Male		Female	
		%		%
<b>SELF NOMINATIONS RECEIVED</b>	82	92.1	7	7.9
<b>CONSULTANTS HOLDING AWARDS (DISTINCTION AWARDS/HIGHER CEA'S)</b>	101	92.7	8	7.3
<b>AWARDS GRANTED IN 2008/2009</b>	15	88.2	2	11.8

**TABLE 3 (1)****ANALYSIS OF HIGHER AWARDS BY HSC TRUST**

	BELFAST TRUST	SOUTH EASTERN TRUST	NORTHERN TRUST	SOUTHERN TRUST	WESTERN TRUST	* OTHERS
<b>NUMBER OF CONSULTANTS</b>	589	149	154	141	169	34
%	47.6	12.1	12.5	11.4	13.7	2.7
<b>NUMBER OF SELF NOMINATIONS</b>	56	12	7	4	6	4
%	62.9	13.5	7.9	4.5	6.7	4.5
<b>AWARDS GRANTED</b>	13	2	-	1	1	-
%	76.4	11.8	-	5.9	5.9	-
<b>NUMBER OF TOTAL AWARDS NOW HELD</b>	80	7	2	4	8	8
<b>% OF TOTAL AWARDS (out of 109)</b>	73.4	6.4	1.9	3.7	7.3	7.3

\* OTHERS INCLUDE:

HSS Boards, Health Promotion Agency, Blood Transfusion Service and Regulation Quality Improvement Authority

**TABLE 4 (1)****ANALYSIS OF NEW HIGHER AWARDS BY AGE**

AGE GROUP	NEW AWARDS		
	Step 11	Step 10	Step 9
35-39			
40-44			1
45-49	1		4
50-54		4	5
55-59		2	
60-64			
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>AVERAGE AGE</b>	<b>47</b>	<b>53</b>	<b>49</b>

**TABLE 5 (1)****ANALYSIS OF HIGHER AWARDS BY ETHNIC ORIGIN**

	WHITE		NOT KNOWN		ETHNIC MINORITY	
		%		%		%
<b>SELF NOMINATIONS RECEIVED</b>	83	93.2	3	3.4	3	3.4
<b>AWARDS GRANTED 2007/2008</b>	15	88.2	1	5.9	1	5.9

**TABLE 6 (1)****ANALYSIS OF HIGHER AWARDS BY COMMUNITY BACKGROUND**

	PC		RCC		NEITHER		NOT KNOWN	
		%		%		%		%
<b>SELF NOMINATIONS RECEIVED</b>	49	55	24	27	13	14.6	3	3.4
<b>AWARDS GRANTED 2007/2008</b>	8	47	6	35.3	2	11.8	1	5.9

## NOTE:

- PC – consultants who declared themselves as members of the Protestant community.  
RCC - consultants who declared themselves as members of the Roman Catholic community.  
NEITHER - consultants who declared themselves as members of neither the Protestant nor the Roman Catholic community.

**TABLE 7 (1)****STEP 9 AND STEP 10 APPLICATIONS – CITATIONS ISSUED TO EMPLOYERS**

<b>EMPLOYER</b>	<b>CITATIONS ISSUED</b>	<b>CITATIONS SUPPORTED</b>	<b>CITATIONS NOT SUPPORTED</b>
<b>Belfast HSC Trust</b>	<b>38</b>	<b>29</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>Northern HSCT</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>South Eastern HSC Trust</b>	<b>14</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>Southern HSC Trust</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Western HSC Trust / Western Board</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Queen's University (Joint Appointees)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>66</b>	<b>45 (68.2%)</b>	<b>21 (31.8%)</b>

**STEP 9 AND STEP10 APPLICATIONS – CITATIONS ISSUED TO SENIOR AWARD HOLDERS**

<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>CITATIONS ISSUED</b>	<b>CITATIONS SUPPORTED</b>	<b>CITATIONS NOT SUPPORTED</b>
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>68</b>	<b>38 (55.9%)</b>	<b>30 (44.1%)</b>

## **PART TWO**

### **REPORT ON THE OUTCOME OF LOWER AWARDS**

1. The Northern Ireland Clinical Excellence Awards Committee (NICEAC) has a monitoring and quality assurance role over the lower awards process. Trusts are required to report annually to NICEAC on the outcome of the local process, providing details of the composition of the local panel, the names of the successful consultants, and a breakdown of the distribution of awards by various groupings. Trusts must also demonstrate that the local process has been completed fairly and in accordance with the guidance issued by the Department.
2. Since the new scheme was introduced there has been concern about the lack of lower awards. As mentioned in Part one of this report, the Department carried out a review of the scheme in 2007-2008 which covered a number of areas including the mechanism for funding lower awards. A number of changes were introduced including: a formula based system for allocating lower awards (a minimum of 0.25 awards per eligible consultant); and step 9 awards to be taken over by the regional committee. The Department allocated an additional £200k in 2008-2009 on a recurrent basis to help Trusts meet the cost of lower awards, in addition to an extra £100k allocated recurrently in 2007-2008.

#### **Results of Monitoring 2008/2009**

3. All five Trusts have now completed their local awards round process for 2008/2009 with a total of 169 lower awards being made in 2008/2009. This compares favourably with 125 awards made in 2007/2008 and 110 in 2006/2007. In view of its concern about the lack of local awards, the Department allocated an additional £100k to Trusts in the 2007/2008 year which helped to contribute to the increase in the overall number of lower awards for that year. A further £200k was allocated to Trusts in the 2008/2009 year to help meet the cost of lower awards required under the 0.25 formula.
4. Trusts were required to report on whether they met the minimum number of awards required under the formula. Three out of the five Trusts either met or exceeded the minimum number of awards required. However, two Trusts did not meet the required number, the South Eastern making 27 awards (37 required) and the Northern making 11 awards (27 required).
  - (i). The South Eastern Trust reported that the unsuccessful applicants had failed to demonstrate that they merited an award, stating that there was insufficient evidence to show that performance was over and above the standard expected. The Committee is not in a position to second guess the Trust's view on this matter, but we would agree in principle that awards should not be made unless they are fully justified.
  - (ii). The Northern Trust reported that for financial reasons they were only able to make 11 awards. It is disappointing to note that the Trust made fewer lower awards this year (having made 14 in 2007/2008) despite being allocated additional funding to help meet the cost of the 0.25 formula and the Department has sought further clarification from the

Trust. The Committee regrets the fact that the number of awards has been curtailed, and would re-iterate its view of the importance of a continuum between the local and regional awards. The scheme as a whole cannot function effectively unless adequate numbers of local awards are made since these represent the foundation from which progression to higher awards should proceed. The importance of this was clearly recognised in the outcome of the review of the scheme, referred to above, and we hope that in future years Trusts will not impose any artificial constraints on awards, up to the maximum required by the new formula.

Table 1(2) gives a breakdown of the number of awards made by Trust. The names of the successful consultants and the current level of award held are listed at the end of Part Two.

5. All Trusts provided details in their reports of the composition of Local Awards Panels. The information supplied indicated that the panels were set up in accordance with the guidance issued by the Department and that the processes adopted by Trusts were completed fairly.

### **Distribution of Lower Awards**

6. An analysis of the distribution of awards by gender, community background, and ethnic origin has been carried out, in terms of applications and awards made. However, we do not hold sufficient data on the overall breakdown of existing lower award holders by community background and ethnic origin. The total number of consultants now in receipt of a lower clinical excellence award/discretionary point is 548 (352 lower CEAs, 196 discretionary points). Table 2(2) gives details of the numbers of consultants in receipt of each lower award/discretionary point.

### ***Gender***

7. The proportion of female consultants applying for a lower award was 19.4%. Female consultants received 20.1% of all lower awards in the 2008-2009 awards round, an increase in 2006/2007 when they received 16%. Overall female consultants hold 24.3 % of lower awards, giving a slight under representation of female consultants at the lower award level (28% of the consultant population are females). Table 3(2) shows the analysis of lower awards by gender.

### ***Community Background***

8. An analysis of consultants who applied for an award shows that 41.9% declared themselves as coming from a Protestant community (PC) background, and 33.9% from a Roman Catholic community background (RCC). A survey of Trusts in 2007 showed that 48% of all consultants were from a PC background and 31.5% were from a RCC background (20% were either “not known” or from “neither PC or RCC background”). An analysis of the lower awards made shows that 42.6% of awards went to consultants declaring a PC background, 36.7% went to consultants declaring a RCC background, 11.2% to “neithers”, and 9.5% were “not knowns”. Table 4(2) gives a breakdown of applications and awards made by community background.

### ***Ethnic Origin***

9. A survey of Trusts in 2007 indicates that 7% of all consultants are from the ethnic minority groupings. 6.9% of consultants (20 applications) who applied for lower awards declared themselves as coming from the smaller ethnic groups. A total of 5 lower awards (3%) went to consultants from ethnic minority groupings. It should be noted that the South Eastern Trust, who made 28 awards, was unable to provide any data on ethnic origin. Table 5(2) gives a breakdown of applications and awards made by ethnic origin.

## LIST OF LOWER AWARDS GRANTED IN 2008/2009

### **STEP 8**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HSC EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Corrigan DB	Public Health Medicine	Southern HSS Board	01/04/2008
McNeill AJ	Cardiology	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Morrow JI	Neurology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Trinick TR	Pathology-Chemical	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008

### **STEP 7**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HSC EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Cassidy CE	Psychiatry-Addictions	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Daly OE	Psychiatry-Adult	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McAllister C	Anaesthetics	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McKinney A	Accident and Emergency	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2008
O'Brien CJ	General Medicine	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Webb CH	Pathology- Microbiology	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008

### **STEP 6**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HSC EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Allen DC	Histopathology-Cytopathology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Bell P	Psychiatry Adult	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Brown MG	General Surgery	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Carson D	Anaesthetics	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Conneally P	Radiology	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Fogarty PP	Obstetrics and Gynaecology	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Hall SR	Radiology	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Jack CM	General Medicine	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Johnston BT	General Medicine	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Leyden PEF	Anaesthetics	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Mackle EJ	General Surgery	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008

**STEP 6** (cont'd)

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HSC EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
McClelland CJ	Orthopaedic and Traumatic Surgery	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McMullan RE	Orthodontics	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Moles KW	Diabetes	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Murray AP	Psychiatry-Child and Adolescent	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Ritchie CM	General Medicine	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Smithson RD	Public Health Medicine	Western HSS Board	01/04/2008
Sweeney LE	Radiology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Trouton TG	Cardiology	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2008

**STEP 5**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HSC EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Cody M	Anaesthetics	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2008
De Courcy Wheeler RHB	Obstetrics and Gynaecology	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Farrell BSM	Public Health Medicine	Southern HSS Board	01/04/2008
Foster JH	Radiology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Foster TJ	Psychiatry-Adult	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Hamilton CA	Public Health Medicine	Western HSS Board	01/04/2008
Ledwith MV	Paediatrics	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Marshall SG	General Surgery	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McCaffrey PM	Geriatric Medicine	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McCloskey BV	Anaesthetics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McKane WR	General Medicine	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Price JH	Obstetrics and Gynaecology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Rooney P	Pathology-Microbiology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Smith MBH	Paediatrics	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Stanley JC	Anaesthetics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008

## **STEP 4**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HSC EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Anderson NH	Pathology-Histopathology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Archbold GPR	Pathology-Chemical	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Best RM	Ophthalmology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Boydell LR	Public Health Medicine	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Campbell WJ	General Surgery	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Chada N	Psychiatry	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Clarke HE	Dental Public Health	Southern HSS Board	01/04/2008
Cody DE	Psychiatry-Adult	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Connolly DF	Psychiatry-Adult	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Connolly IH	Orthodontics	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Corrigan NP	Paediatrics	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Craig BF	Orthopaedic and Traumatic Surgery	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Cullen M	Sports and Exercise Medicine	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Dornan OJ	Accident and Emergency	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Ellis PK	Radiology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Gardiner PV	Rheumatology	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Ghareeb EM	General Surgery	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Hutton SEM	Paediatrics	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Kettle PJ	Pathology-Haematology	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Laverick MD	Orthopaedic and Traumatic Surgery	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Loughrey AC	Pathology-Microbiology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Martyn CJ	Accident and Emergency	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McBride WT	Anaesthetics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McCoy EP	Anaesthetics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McDonnell CM	Psychiatry-Adult	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McGarry PJ	Psychiatrist-Adult	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McGarvey L	General Medicine	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McMillan JC	Dermatology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Nelson WE	Nephrology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008

**STEP 4** (cont'd)

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HSC EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
O'Kane M	Psychiatry	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Quigley CN	Psychiatry-Adult	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Tohani VK	Communicable Disease Control	Southern HSS Board	01/04/2008
Wiggam MI	Geriatric Medicine	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008

**STEP 3**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HSC EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Anderson WA	General Medicine	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Bergin SP	Public Health Medicine	Southern HSS Board	01/04/2008
Elliott JR	Orthopaedic and Traumatic	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Elliott MJ	Radiology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Graham A	Cardiothoracic Surgery	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Handley JM	Dermatology	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Harding TAC	General Medicine	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Harte RJ	Clinical Oncology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Hogan MM	Paediatrics	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Imrie CB	Paediatrics	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Loughrey GJ	Radiology	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Lowry JP	Radiology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
MacGowan SW	Cardiothoracic Surgery	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McAlinden PM	Paediatrics	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McCaughey CP	Microbiology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McCluggage WG	Histopathology-Cytopathology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McEneaney DJ	Cardiology	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McLoughlin CC	Anaesthetics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Nelson WM	Radiology	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Rooney DP	General Medicine	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Steen HJ	Paediatrics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Wilson RH	Medical Oncology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008

## **STEP 2**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HSC EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Anderson J	Psychiatry-Old-Age	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Boyd HK	Pathology-Haematology	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Bryson CA	Obstetrics and Gynaecology	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Chakravarthy U	Ophthalmology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Craig JS	Obstetrics and Gynaecology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Devine MJ	Public Health Medicine	Northern HSS Board	01/04/2008
Deyermund RE	Anaesthetics	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Finch MBG	Rheumatology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Flynn P	Radiology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Herity NA	Cardiology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Hughes DA	Anaesthetics	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Hull DR	Haematology	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Johnston CD	Orthodontics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Johnston PW	Cardiology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Kennedy RJ	General Surgery	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Lowry DW	Anaesthetics	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Lyons JDM	Anaesthetics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Mackin JG	Paediatrics	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Mairs AP	Public Health Medicine	Northern HSS Board	01/04/2008
Marley JJ	Oral Surgery	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McAtamney DG	Anaesthetics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McBrien ME	Anaesthetics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McConnell RS	Neurosurgery	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McGinnity FG	Ophthalmology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Menown IBA	Cardiology	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Mitchell CA	Restorative Dentistry	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Nugent AM	General Medicine	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
O'Brien A	Urology	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
O'Rourke DM	Pathology-Histopathology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008

**STEP 2** (cont'd)

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HSC EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
O'Sullivan J	Clinical Oncology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Rodgers C	General Medicine	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Scullion DF	Anaesthetics	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Shields DA	Psychiatry	South Eastern Trust	01/04/2008
Smyth A	General Medicine	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Smyth J	General Medicine	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008

**STEP 1**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HSC EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Armstrong DK	Dermatology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Bowers MJ	Haematology	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Boyd CS	Radiology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Caddy G	General Medicine	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Cairns AP	Rheumatology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Carabine UA	Anaesthetics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Clarke C	Anaesthetics	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Collins A	Radiology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Donaldson M	Dental Public Health Medicine	Northern HSS Board	01/04/2008
Drake MBG	Haematology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Epanomeritakis E	General Surgery	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Falls NBT	Paediatrics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Forbes R	Neurology	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Gillespie J	Radiology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Glover PJ	Anaesthetics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Hagan C	Urology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Harney JA	Clinical Oncology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Harper CV	Public Health Medicine	Northern HSS Board	01/04/2008
Harper KW	Anaesthetics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Hedderwick SA	Infectious Diseases	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008

**STEP 1** (cont'd)

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>HSC EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Herron BM	Neuropathology-Histopathology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Hill P	Obstetrics and Gynaecology	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Hughes DM	Psychiatry-Learning Disability	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Johnston D	Orthodontics	Northern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Keaney AAM	Anaesthetics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Kelly F	Nephrology	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Love MHS	Radiology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McAteer J	Anaesthetics	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McCarroll CP	Anaesthetics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McConnell EM	General Medicine	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McKinney KA	Obstetrics and Gynaecology	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McManus DT	Histopathology-Cytopathology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
McSorley P	Anaesthetics	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Milliken C	Psychiatry-Learning Disability	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Mullan BA	Anaesthetics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Mzimba Z	General Surgery	Western HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Ong GML	Pathology-Microbiology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Owen TA	Public Health Medicine	Southern HSS Board	01/04/2008
Perry M	Oral Surgery	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Reid A	Paediatrics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Rice PF	Radiology	Southern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Robinson S	Anaesthetics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Sands A	Paediatric Cardiology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Sheridan SM	Restorative Dentistry	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Stafford M	Anaesthetics	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Stanley JC	Anaesthetics	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Turner J	Radiology	South Eastern HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Warke TJ	General Medicine	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008
Woods JD	Nephrology	Belfast HSC Trust	01/04/2008

**TABLE 1(2)**

**OUTCOME OF LOWER CLINICAL EXCELLENCE AWARDS  
2008-2009**

HSC Trust	Awards Round Completed	Awards Made	Number of Consultants eligible to apply for a Lower Award	Number of Applications Received	Number of awards available per 0.25 formula	Number of Awards Made
Northern	Yes	Yes	110	37	27	11
Southern	Yes	Yes	105	42	26	26
Belfast	Yes	Yes	336	128	84	84
South Eastern	Yes	Yes	147	52	37	27
Western	Yes	Yes	107	30	26	27

**TABLE 2 (2)**

**CONSULTANTS IN RECEIPT OF LOWER CLINICAL EXCELLENCE AWARDS / DISCRETIONARY POINTS**

CLINICAL EXCELLENCE AWARDS		DISCRETIONARY POINTS	
STEP 1	76	1	66
STEP 2	59	2	48
STEP 3	50	3	30
STEP 4	54	4	23
STEP 5	38	5	13
STEP 6	40	6	8
STEP 7	18	7	6
STEP 8	12	8	2
STEP 9 (L)	5		-
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>352</b>		<b>196</b>
<b>GRAND TOTAL</b>		<b>548</b>	

**NOTE:**

Number of consultants holding higher clinical excellence awards: - 109

**TABLE 3 (2)**

**ANALYSIS OF LOWER AWARDS BY GENDER**

	Male		Female	
		%		%
<b>Applications Received</b>	<b>233</b>	<b>80.6</b>	<b>56</b>	<b>19.4</b>
<b>Awards Granted in 2008/2009</b>	<b>135</b>	<b>79.9</b>	<b>34</b>	<b>20.1</b>
<b>Consultants Holding Awards (Discretionary Points/Lower CEA's)</b>	<b>415</b>	<b>75.7</b>	<b>133</b>	<b>24.3</b>

**TABLE 4 (2)**

**ANALYSIS OF LOWER AWARDS BY COMMUNITY BACKGROUND**

	PC		RCC		NEITHER		NOT KNOWN	
		%		%		%		%
<b>Applications Received</b>	<b>121</b>	<b>41.9</b>	<b>98</b>	<b>33.9</b>	<b>36</b>	<b>12.5</b>	<b>34</b>	<b>11.7</b>
<b>Awards Granted in 2008/2009</b>	<b>72</b>	<b>42.6</b>	<b>62</b>	<b>36.7</b>	<b>19</b>	<b>11.2</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>9.5</b>

**NOTE**

PC  
RCC  
NEITHER

consultants who declared themselves as members of the Protestant community.  
consultants who declared themselves as members of the Roman Catholic community.  
consultants who declared themselves as members of neither the Protestant nor the Roman Catholic community.

**TABLE 5 (2)**

**ANALYSIS OF LOWER AWARDS BY ETHNIC ORIGIN**

	WHITE		NOT KNOWN		ETHNIC MINORITY	
		%		%		%
<b>Applications Received</b>	<b>199</b>	<b>68.9</b>	<b>18</b>	<b>6.2</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>6.9</b>
<b>Awards Granted in 2008/2009</b>	<b>131</b>	<b>77.5</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>3.0</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>3.0</b>

**NOTE**

This excludes the South Eastern Trust who received 52 applications and made 28 awards

**NORTHERN IRELAND CLINICAL EXCELLENCE AWARDS COMMITTEE**

**MEMBERSHIP 2008-2009 AWARDS ROUND**

**CHAIRMAN**

Mr Patrick Carvill

Former permanent secretary Department of Education for Northern Ireland (1990-1998) and Department of Finance and Personnel (1998-2003); Commissioner, South Eastern Education and Library Board (2006 to date)

**MEDICAL DIRECTOR**

Professor Robert W Stout

Former Professor of Geriatric Medicine at Queen's University Belfast and Consultant Physician at Belfast City Hospital

**MEMBERS**

Mrs Anne Balmer

Chairman Southern Health and Social Care Trust

Dr Griselda Cooper

Senior Lecturer in Anaesthesia and Consultant Anaesthetist at Birmingham's Women's Hospital

Mrs Diane Drennan

Solicitor in the Northern Ireland Law Commission.

Ms Norma Evans

Chief Executive Northern Health and Social Care Trust

Dr John Jenkins

Senior Lecturer in Child Health and a Consultant Paediatrician in Northern Health and Social Care Trust

Professor Curly Morris

Former Consultant Haematologist in Belfast Health and Social Care Trust

Professor Lesley Regan

Deputy Head of Division Surgery, Oncology, Reproductive Biology, Anaesthetics, Faculty of Medicine, Imperial College London

**APPENDIX B****DISTINCTION AWARD HOLDERS IN  
NORTHERN IRELAND****A+ AWARD HOLDERS**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Atkinson A B	Medicine/Endocrinology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/10/2003
Mirakhur R K	Anaesthetics	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust/QUB	01/10/2001

**A AWARD  
HOLDERS**

Boyle DD	Obstetrics and Gynaecology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/10/2003
Callender M E	General Medicine	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2003
Campbell W I	Anaesthetics	South Eastern Health and Social Care Trust	01/08/2001
Carson D J	Paediatrics	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust/QUB	27/04/2002
Cooper S J	Psychiatry-Adult	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust/QUB	01/07/2002
Crean P M	Anaesthetics	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/10/2004
Evans A E	Public Health Medicine	Eastern Health and Social Services Board/QUB	13/08/1999
Fee J P H	Anaesthetics	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust/QUB	02/01/2000
Hawkins S A	Neurology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust/QUB	01/10/2001
Johnston G D	Clinical Pharmacology and Therapeutics	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust/QUB	01/10/1999
Kaluskar S K	ENT	Western Health and Social Care Trust	03/08/2004
Lamey P-J	Oral Medicine	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust/QUB	01/10/2001
MacMahon J	General Medicine	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/10/2003
Maw R D	Genitourinary Medicine	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2004
McClelland W M	Pathology/Haematology	N.I.Blood Transfusion Service Agency	01/10/2004
McMurray T J	Anaesthetics	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	10/09/2003
Spence R A J	General Surgery	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2004

**B AWARD  
HOLDERS**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Abram W P	Clinical Oncology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/08/2001
Adams D A	ENT	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust/QUB	12/09/2000
Andrews W J	General Medicine	Northern Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2001
Bell A H	Paediatrics	NI Health Promotion Agency	01/10/2002
Beverland D E	Orthopaedic & Traumatic Surgery	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2003
Bingham EA	Dermatology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/08/1998
Campbell F C	Gastroenterological Surgery	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust/QUB	01/04/2001
Collins J S A	General Medicine	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/10/2003
Cranley B	General Surgery	Southern Health and Social Care Trust	09/06/2000
Dinsmore W W	Genitourinary Medicine	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/10/2004
Eedy D J	Dermatology	Southern Health and Social Care Trust	03/08/2004
Fulton R A	Dermatology	Western Health and Social Care Trust	28/01/2001
Gilmore D H	Geriatric Medicine	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2004
Gregg T A	Paediatric Dentistry	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2001
Johnston P B	Ophthalmology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/10/1995
Kelly J F	Geriatric Medicine	Western Health and Social Care Trust	01/02/2003
Maxwell R J	General Surgery	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/09/2000
McClure N	Obstetrics and Gynaecology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust/QUB	01/06/2003
McCluskey D R	General Medicine	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust/QUB	01/10/2002
McConnell W W M	Public Health Medicine	Western Health and Social Care Trust	02/04/1997
McGuigan J A	Thoracic Surgery	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/10/2000
Murray J M	Anaesthetics	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust/QUB	01/04/2004
Nicholls D P	General Medicine	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	31/05/1999
Orr I A	Anaesthetics	Southern Health and Social Care Trust	01/08/2001
Sharma N K	Ophthalmology	Western Health and Social Care Trust	01/09/2002

Stewart D G T	Public Health Medicine	Regulation Quality and Improvement Authority	31/12/2002
---------------	------------------------	--	------------

**B AWARD  
HOLDERS cont'd**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Taggart H M	Geriatric Medicine	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/10/2000
Taylor R H	Anaesthetics	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/10/2001
Telford A M	Public Health Medicine	Southern Health and Social Services Board	01/10/1999
Traub A I	Obstetrics and Gynaecology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2000
Varma M P S	General Medicine	Western Health and Social Care Trust	01/10/2004
Watson J D	Public Health Medicine	Northern Health and Social Services Board	02/05/1999
Wray A R	Orthopaedic & Traumatic Surgery	Western Health and Social Care Trust	01/06/2003

**APPENDIX C****HIGHER CLINICAL EXCELLENCE AWARD HOLDERS IN  
NORTHERN IRELAND****STEP 12 AWARD HOLDERS**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Doherty CC	Renal Medicine	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2006
Elborn JS	Medicine -Respiratory	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust/QUB	01/04/2007
Jenkins J G	Paediatrics	Northern Health and Social Care Trust /QUB	01/04/2007
Johnston PG	Medical Oncology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust/QUB	01/04/2006
Savage JM	Paediatrics	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust/QUB	01/04/2005

**STEP 11 AWARD HOLDERS**

Young IS	Chemical Pathology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
----------	--------------------	--------------------------------------	------------

**STEP 10 AWARD HOLDERS**

Bell P M	General Medicine	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2006
Beringer T R O	Geriatric Medicine	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2006
Burden D J	Orthodontics	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust/QUB	01/04/2007
Coyle P V	Pathology-Medical Microbiology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2005
Craig B G	Paediatric Cardiology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2007
Daly J G	Medicine -Respiratory	Western Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2006
Diamond T	General Surgery	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
Dornan J C	Obstetrics and Gynaecology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2006
Edgar J D	Pathology-Immunology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2007
Elliott P M	Anaesthetics	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2007
Farling P A	Anaesthetics	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2006
Fullerton K J	Geriatric Medicine	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2006

Gardiner K R	General Surgery	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2007
<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
<b>STEP 10</b> (cont'd)			
Hannon R J	General Surgery	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
Harper M A	Obstetrics and Gynaecology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2005
Higginson J D S	Cardiology	South Eastern Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2007
Houston R F	Clinical Oncology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2006
Irwin S T	General Surgery	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2006
Jackson P T	Paediatrics	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2007
Johnston J R	Anaesthetics	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2006
Johnston L C	Radiology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2006
Jones F G C	Pathology-Haematology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2005
Kee F	Public Health Medicine	Northern Health and Social Services Board/QUB	01/04/2005
Kirk S J	General Surgery	South Eastern Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2007
Lavery G G	Anaesthetics	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2006
Linden G J	Periodontology- Restorative Dentistry	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust/QUB	01/04/2007
Loughran P G	Anaesthetics	Southern Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
Lowry K G	Intensive Care	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2007
Maxwell A P	Nephrology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust/QUB	01/04/2006
McBride M O	HIV and Genitourinary Medicine	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2007
McDonald G H	Psychiatry-Adult	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2007
McGinnity M G A	Psychiatry-Adult	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
McMullin M F	Pathology-Haematology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust/QUB	01/04/2005
McVeigh G E	Clinical Pharmacology and Therapeutics	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust/QUB	01/04/2007
Passmore A P	Geriatric Medicine	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust/QUB	01/04/2008
Patterson D G	Psychiatry-Adult	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2006
Shields M D	Paediatrics	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust/QUB	01/04/2005

Smyth E T M	Pathology-Medical Microbiology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2005
<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
<b>STEP 10 cont'd</b>			
Stewart M C	Paediatrics	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust/QUB	01/04/2008
Taylor I C	Geriatric Medicine	South Eastern Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2007
Toner J G	ENT	South Eastern Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2007

**STEP 9**

<b>NAME</b>	<b>SPECIALTY</b>	<b>EMPLOYER</b>	<b>DATE OF AWARD</b>
Brown JH	Nephrology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
Hill DA	Anaesthetics	South Eastern Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
Hussey DL	Restorative Dentistry	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
Kelly BE	Radiology	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
McCance DR	General Medicine	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
Moorehead RJ	General Surgery	South Eastern Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
Morrison PJ	Clinical Genetics	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
O'Kane MJ	Clinical Chemistry	Western Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
Soong CV	General Surgery Spec. Int. Vascular Surgery	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008
Stevens AB	Occupational Health	Belfast Health and Social Care Trust	01/04/2008

